A Critical Assessment of Umm Kulthum's Marriage to Umar

Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani

Translated by
Jawid Akbari

Al-Islam.org

Author(s):

Sayyid Ali al-Husayni al-Milani [3]

This text discusses about Umm Kulthum's marriage to Umar ibn Al-Khattab, presenting the narrations from the most famous books authored by Sunni scholars, carefully examining the chains of the narrations, their significations, the narrators and their goals.

Translator(s):

Jawid Akbari [4]

Category:

Early Islamic History [5]

Miscellaneous information:
A Critical Assessment of Umm Kulthum's Marriage to Umar Ayatollah Sayyid Ali Hussaini Milani Translated by Jawid Akbari Islamic Truths Center A Series of Theological Studies www.al-milani.com

Featured Category:

Debates & discussions [6]
Resources for Further Research [7]
Responses to Misconceptions [8]

Person Tags:

Umm Kulthum [9]
Umar b. al-Khattab [10]

With the prophetic mission of Prophet Muhammad (S), the seal of the prophets, the last and the most perfect divine religion was conveyed to humanity and prophethood came to an end. The religion of Islam emerged in Mecca but after twenty three years of arduous efforts made by the Messenger of Allah (S) and a handful of his loyal companions it spread all over the Arabian Peninsula.

The continuation of this divine mission was an important undertaking that was entrusted publicly on Dhul Hijja, the eighteenth, by Glorious Allah, to Ali (a.s.), the Commander of the Faithful and the first personality after the Holy Prophet (S) in the world of Islam.

With the proclamation of Hazrat Ali's guardianship and succession on this day, divine blessings were

completed and the religion of Islam was perfected and announced as the only religion chosen by Allah. That was how unbelievers and pagans despaired of destroying Islam.

Soon after the demise of the Messenger of Allah (S), some of the companions of the Holy Prophet (S), based on their pre-hatched conspiracies, deviated from the course of guidance and leadership. They closed the gate of the city of knowledge putting Muslims in perplexity. From the very beginning of their rule, they placed the truths of Islam – that were like the shining sun – behind the dark clouds of doubt and skepticism by way of putting a ban on recording prophetic narrations, spreading fabricated narrations, casting doubts and embarking on hypocritical and deceptive tactics.

Obviously, in spite of all conspiracies hatched by the enemies of Islam, the truths of Islam and noble sayings of the Messenger of Allah (S) were promulgated by the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.), his successors and a few of his devout companions and those truths continued to flow and manifest themselves in one way or the other in the course of history. By explaining the truths, they did away with doubts, specious arguments, and wicked beliefs inculcated by the enemies of Islam, and made the truth clear to all.

In this respect, great scholars and men of knowledge such as Sheikh Mufid, Sayyid Murtadha, Khaja Nasir, Allamah Hilli, Qadhi Nurullah, Mir Hamid Hussain, Sayyid Sharafuddin, Allamah Amini etc. having been glittering like shining stars, since they are the ones who defended Islamic truths, explained the realities of the school of Ahl Al-Bayt (a.s.) and dealt with spurious arguments using their tongues and pens.

In our era, one of the outstanding scholars and researchers who has, with his eloquent pen and expressive writing, explained the truths of the religion of Islam and astutely defended the imamate and wilayah (guardianship) of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) is Ayatollah Sayyid Ali Husaini Milani, a great researcher.

The Islamic Truths Center is proud to take up the task of reviving the fruitful and precious works of that great researcher by reviewing, translating and publishing them in a bid to make them available to students, scientific figures and those who are in search of Islamic truths.

The book in your hand is a translation of one of his works which will now acquaint the English readers with Islamic truths. It is expected that this humble effort will earn the pleasure of the Remnant of Allah, the Imam of Time, may Allah hasten his reappearance.

Islamic Truths Center

The purpose of writing this book is to conduct a research into the narrations or reports regarding Umar‘s marriage to Umm Kulthum, the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali, peace be upon him. This

event has always been used by a group of people to deny the bitter incidents and adverse events that took place during the early period of Islam in regards to Ali bin Abi Talib and Fatima Zahra, peace be upon them. Thus, they argue as such:

If what is known as Umar's assault on Ali's house were correct and his attack led to the martyrdom of Fatima, the daughter of Holy Prophet (S), such a marriage or matrimony would not have taken place but it took place and we conclude, therefore, that the alleged events are not true and that Ali (a.s.) and Umar were in quite good terms with each other.

This study delves into the narrations regarding Umar's marriage to Umm Kulthum in a bid to clarify whether the foregoing argument is complete and reasonable or invalid and fruitless.

Obviously, such an argument can be complete and acceptable only when the subject around which we discuss should have existed. That is to say, it must be proved, in the first place, that the Commander of Faithful, Ali (a.s.) had a daughter by the name Umm Kulthum. Therefore, if a daughter by this name never existed, or Fatima Zahra (a.s.) did not have such a daughter – as stated by some scholars, the above argument would be incomplete and out of place.

It could be termed as a marriage between Umar and Umm Kulthum by simply pronouncing the formula of marriage contract. If the conclusion of marriage contract between those two depends on conjugal relations, this argument will again be incomplete and you will see that there is no concrete evidence to show that the two sides had conjugal relations.

Assuming that such a marriage took place, the argument would be justified only when the marriage should have taken place with complete consent and approbation. In case the marriage, as stated by the narrations of the Two Sects, has taken place under coercion, intimidation and pressure, making recourse to such an argument would then be counterproductive and it will be counted as another injustice done to the Prophet's progeny (a.s.).

In the name of Allah, the Compassionate the Merciful

All praise is due to Allah, the Lord of the worlds. May the peace and blessings of Allah be upon our Master, Muhammad, and his pure family, and may the curse of Allah be upon all of their enemies.

Since the early Islamic centuries as of now, many inquiries and investigations have been made and answers given concerning the following narration: "The Commander of Faithful, Ali (a.s.) married his daughter to Umar b. Khattab".

As well, books, treatises and articles have been written in this regard. For instance, Sheikh Mufid, may Allah be pleased with him, has authored two well-researched treatises in this regard, of which one has been presented in the book titled Ajwebat Al-Masail Al-Sarawiyah in reply to the tenth question and the

other has been presented in Ajwebat Al-Masail Al-Hajibiyah in reply to the fifteenth question.

The present book is the result of research concerning this incident. In this study, first of all, the original narration has been cited from the most famous Sunni books whereupon their chains of transmission as well as their significations have been examined and criticized.

This study aims to examine the story, unveil and clarify the truth and finally put a stop to controversies and disputes in this regard.

And Allah is Felicitous and He is the Helper.

One of the narrations widely known among Sunni Muslims is the narration to which they have made recourse in order to argue that the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) married out his daughter, Umm Kulthum, to Umar. They have transmitted this narration in their sources and we will cite it from their most famous booksOne of the narrations widely known among Sunni Muslims is the narration to which they have made recourse in order to argue that the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) married out his daughter, Umm Kulthum, to Umar. They have transmitted this narration in their sources and we will cite it from their most famous books

1. Ibn Sa'ad's Narrations in Al-Tabaqat Al-Kubra

As far as we know, the earliest narrator who has passed on this tradition is Muhammad bin Sa'ad b. Mani' Zuhri (d. 230 A.H), the author of Al- Tabaqat Al-Kubra. He has included several narrations in his book on this subject which are as follows.

The first narration

Umm Kulthum was the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib ibn Abdul Muttalib ibn Hashim ibn Abd Manaf ibn Qusai. Her mother was Fatima, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S)1 and Khadijah bint Khuwailid ibn Asad ibn Abdul Uzza ibn Qusai. She was a young girl when Umar married her. The fruit of this marriage was a son called Zaid and a daughter called Ruqayyah. Umm Kulthum remained Umar's wife until he was killed.

After Umar, Awn ibn Ja'far ibn Abi Talib ibn Abdul Muttalib married her (!)2, but Awn too died and thereupon, Awn's brother, Muhammad ibn Ja'far ibn Abi Talib became her husband. He too, passed away.

Then his brother, Abdullah ibn Ja'far ibn Abi Talib married Umm Kulthum after the death of her sister, Zainab, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib (a.s.). Umm Kulthum made reference to it saying: "I feel embarrassed towards Asma bint Umais whose two sons died when they were in my company, and I am

worried about the third one! Umm Kulthum died in Abdullah ibn Ja'far's house and did not bear a child with anyone of them!"

The second narration

Umar ibn Al-Khattab asked Ali ibn Abi Talib for the hand of Umm Kulthum in marriage. Ali said: "I have kept my daughters for the sons of Ja'far."

Umar said: "Marry her to me, O Abul Hasan, for by Allah, there is no man on the face of the earth who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve."

Ali said: "I have done so."

Then Umar came to the Muhajirun (lit. migrants) between the grave (of Rasul-Allah) and the pulpit. They — Ali, Uthman, Zubayr, Talhah and Abd ar-Rahman — used to sit there, and whenever a matter used to arrive from the frontiers, Umar would come to them there and consult with them. He came to them and said: "Congratulate me."

They congratulated him, and asked: "With whom are we congratulating you, O Amirul Mu'meneen?"

He replied: "With the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib.3

Then he told them the story and said that he had heard the Prophet (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

"Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage."4

I was a companion of the Prophet and I also loved this relationship to be maintained.

The third narration

Waki' ibn Jarrah narrates from Husham ibn Sa'ad, he from Ataa Khurasani that he said: "Umar paid forty thousand [dirhams] as dowry [marriage gift] to Umm Kulthum!"

The fourth narration

Muhammad ibn Umar Waqidi and others have said, "Umar asked Ali for the hand of his daughter, Umm Kulthum, in marriage. Ali replied that she had not yet attained the age (of puberty)."

Umar replied: "By Allah, this is not true. You do not want her to marry me. If she is underage, send her to me."

Thus, Ali called Umm Kulthum, they prepared her and made her up. Then he asked for a piece of cloth which he folded and handed over to Umm Kulthum telling her to take the garment to Amirul Mu'meneen and tell him: "My father has sent me to you instructing me to convey you his greetings and said that if you liked the garment, take it or else, return it!"

When Umm Kulthum went to Umar, the latter said: "May Allah bless you and your father, I like it."

Umm Kulthum returned to his father and said: "He did not unfold the garment, but just looked at me!"

Then Ali married her to Umar and she bore him a child named Zaid.

The fifth narration

Waki'i ibn Jarrah narrates from Ismail ibn Abi Khalid, he from Aamir Sha'bi that both Zaid ibn Umar and Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali, died. Ibn Umar offered funeral prayer consisting of four takbirs (Allahu Akbar). He placed Zaid on the side he had stood and Umm Kulthum in the direction of Qiblah and prayed on both of them.

The sixth narration

Ubaidullah ibn Musa says, "Israil narrates from Abi Hasin, he from Aamir who said, 'Ibn Umar offered a funeral prayer on Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali, and her son. He placed Zaid on his side and prayed on those two.'"

Waki'i has reported a similar account from Zaid ibn Habib, from Sha'abi and added: "During the (funeral) prayer, Hasan and Husain, the sons of Ali, Muhammad ibn Hanafiyah, Abdullah ibn Abbas and Abdullah ibn Ja'far stood praying behind ibn Umar."

The seventh narration

Ubaidullah ibn Musa and Israil have narrated from Jabir, he from Aamir Sha'bi that he said: During the prayer on the corpse of Zaid ibn Umar ibn Khattab, Abdullah ibn Umar led the prayer while Hasan and Husain prayed behind him. Had he known that it was good to say more takbir' (Allahu Akbar), he would have said it."

The eighth narration

Ubaidullah ibn Musa narrates from Israil, from Suddi, from Abdullah ibn Baha that he said, "I saw Ibn Umar pray on Umm Kulthum and Zaid ibn Umar ibn Khattab and that he placed Zaid on the side where the Imam (the prayer leader) was standing while Hasan and Husain were witnessing the prayer."

The ninth narration

Waki'ibn Jarrah, from Hammad ibn Salamah, narrates that Ammar ibn Abi Ammar (Mawla5 of Bani Hashim) said, "I was present on the day on which Saeid ibn Aas, who was then the governor of Medina, prayed on those two with eighty people from the companions of Prophet Muhammad (S) following him in prayer."

The tenth narration

Ja'far ibn Awn narrates from ibn Jurayh that Nafi' said, "The bodies of Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib and wife of Umar ibn Khattab and her son Zaid were brought in for funeral prayer. On that day Saeid ibn Aas was the prayer leader."

The eleventh narration

Abdullah ibn Numair narrates from Ismail, he from Ibn Abi Khalid who narrates from Aamir that, 'Ibn Umar offered prayers on the dead bodies of his brother Zaid and that of Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali. The corpses of those two were in one casket and Zaid's body was on the side close to the prayer leader."6

2. Dulabi's Narrations in Al-Durriyat Al-Tahira

Another scholar who has reported and recorded narrations in this regard is Abu Bushr Muhammad ibn Ahmad Al-Dulabi (d. 310 A.H). In his Al- Durriyat Al-Tahira, he has reported several narrations regarding Umm Kulthum bint Fatima, daughter of the Holy Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants.

The first narration

Al-Dulabi says, "I heard Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar saying: I heard Yunus ibn Bukair say that he had heard from Ibn Ishaq that Fatima, the daughter of the Holy Prophet (S), gave birth to three sons named Hasan, Husain and Mohsin. The latter died at a young age. She also gave birth to two daughters named Umm Kulthum and Zainab."

The second narration

Ibn Ishaq says, "Aasim ibn Umar ibn Qatadah narrated to me as such: Umar asked Ali for the hand of his daughter, Umm Kulthum in marriage and Ali replied that she had not yet attained the age (of maturity).

Umar replied, "By Allah, this is not true...7 You do not want her to marry me. If she is underage, send her to me."

Thus, Ali gave his daughter Umm Kulthum a dress and asked her to go to Umar and tell him that her father wanted to know what this dress was for. When she came to Umar and gave him the message, he grabbed her hand and forcibly pulled her towards himself. Umm Kulthum asked him to leave her hand, which Umar did and said, “You are a very mannered lady with great morals…8 Go and tell your father that you are very pretty and you are not what he said of you!”

With that Ali married Umm Kulthum to Umar.

The third narration

Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar narrates from Yunus ibn Bukair, from Khalid ibn Saleh, from Waqid ibn Abdullah ibn Umar, from some of his relatives that Umar ibn Khattab Umar ibn Khattab asked Ali for the hand of his daughter, Umm Kalthum bint Fatima (daughter of the Holy Prophet (S)) in marriage.

Ali said to him, “She has other guardians also, wait until I get their permission. Then Ali (a.s.) went to Fatima‘s sons and informed them about Umar‘s proposal whereupon they said, “Marry her to him.”

Ali called Umm Kulthum, who was then a young girl then, and said to her, “Go to the Commander of the Faithful, and tell him: My father sends you his regards and says that he has fulfilled your wish.”

Upon reaching Umar‘s house, Umm Kulthum conveyed him her father‘s message whereupon Umar grabbed her and held her to his bosom (!!) and said, “I sought Umm Kulthum‘s hand in marriage and her father married her to me.”

They said to Umar, “What do you mean? She is a little girl?!”

Umar said, "Do not disparage me [for marrying a young girl], for I heard the Prophet say, upon him be blessings and peace:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and lineage.’

I desired to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.”

The fourth narration

Abdul Rahman ibn Khalid ibn Muni‘ says, “Habib, the writer of Malik ibn Anas‘s book, narrates from Abdul Aziz Darawerdi, from Zaid ibn Aslam, from his father, who was the freed slave of Umar ibn Khattab, saying, ‘Umar asked Ali for Umm Kulthum‘s hand in marriage whereupon Ali discussed the

matter with Abbas, Aqil and Hasan. Aqil was annoyed telling Ali, ‘The lapse of days and months will only add to your lack of insight and astuteness in your work. By Allah, if you do this, such and such will happen.’

Ali told Abbas, ‘By Allah, he is not talking wishfully, but the whip of Umar has impelled him to say what you are hearing.’9

Therefore, Hazrat Amir (a.s.) did not declare his acceptance to this marriage to be out of good will.

Of course the surprising part is in the rest of the above narration, where we are seeing that the opinion of Amirul Mu‘uminin Ali (a.s.) changed at once; and that too was not because of the threats from Umar, but because of the urge of Umar to form a relationship with the Messenger of Allah (S) (!!).

Then Ali turned to Aqil and said, “Oh Aqil, I swear by Allah that it is not because of my inclination to you and your opinion, but Umar ibn Khattab informed me that he heard the Messenger of Allah (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.”

The fifth narration

Abdul Aziz ibn Muni‘ has narrated from Abu Al– Darda‘ Marwazi, from Khalid ibn Khedash; also, Ishaq ibn Ibrahim ibn Muhammad ibn Sulaiman ibn Bilal ibn Abi Al–Darda‘ Ansari has reported from Abu Jamahir Muhammad ibn Uthman who said, “Abdullah ibn Zaid ibn Aslam, from his father, from his grandfather, narrated that Umar ibn Khattab, married Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib, with a dowry of 40,000 dirhams!”

The sixth narration

Abu Osama Abdullah ibn Muhammad, from Hajjaj ibn Abi Muni‘, from his grandfather, from Zuhri who narrates, “Umar ibn Khattab married Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali and his wife Fatima and they were blessed with a baby boy named Zaid.”

The seventh narration

Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar, from Yunus ibn Bukair, from Ibn Ishaq who narrated, “Umar ibn Khattab married Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali and they were blessed with a baby boy named Zaid and a daughter. Umar died whilst she was alive.”

The eighth narration

Abu Osamah Abdullah ibn Muhammad Halabi, from Hajjaj ibn Abi Muni‘, from his father, from Zuhri who narrates, “After Umar ibn Khattab, Awn ibn Ja‘far ibn Abi Talib married Umm Kulthum (!!) and she did not bear a child from Awn, until the latter died.

The ninth narration

Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar, from Yunus ibn Bukair, from Ishaq, who narrates, “When Umar, the husband of Umm Kulthum bint Ali, died, Awn ibn Ja‘far married Umm Kulthum and he also died in her lifetime without her bearing a child with him.”

The tenth narration

Ibn Ishaq says, “My father Ishaaq ibn Yasaar narrates from Hasan ibn Hasan ibn Ali ibn Abi Talib, who said, ‘When Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib was widowed of Umar, her brothers Hasan and Husain went to her and said, ‘You are known as the first lady of Islam and the daughter of the best lady of the world. We swear by Allah that if you leave your decision to Ali, he will definitely marry you to one of his orphans (!!) and if you wish to get much wealth, you will definitely get it.’

‘I swear by Allah, no sooner they got up than Ali arrived while he was leaning on his walking stick. Praising and thanking Allah, he reminded them of their status and dignity to the Prophet of Allah (S) and said: ‘O the children of Fatima, you are aware of your status and dignity and you know well that I have given you priority over my other children owing to your position and relationship to the Messenger of Allah (S).’

They said, ‘You are right, may Allah bless you and may He reward you on our behalf.’

Ali turned to his daughter and said, ‘My daughter, Allah has granted you the authority to handle your matter yourself, but I wish you leave that to me.’

Umm Kulthum said, ‘Dear father, I swear by Allah that I am also a woman, and I too have the aspirations and desires of all other women. I would love to enjoy the world as much as any other women do; I wish to decide for myself what I should do in this regard.’

Ali said, ‘My daughter, I swear by Allah that it is not your view but rather that of these two!’

Then he stood up and said, ‘You will either do this or you will never talk to any of these two!’

Hasan and Husain grabbed their father‘s dress and said, ‘Dear father, sit down. By Allah, we cannot afford to miss you. Then they told Umm Kulthum, ‘Leave the decision of your marriage to him.’

Umm Kulthum said, ‘I have done so.’

Ali said, ‘I will marry you to Awn ibn Ja‘far, who is an adolescent.’

Thereupon, Ali returned to Umm Kulthum taking her four thousand dirham. Then he informed his nephew and sent her to him.

Hasan ibn Hasan says: ‘By Allah, ever since the beginning of creation as of now, I know of no love to be like her love of Awn.’”0

The eleventh narration

Abu Ishaq, Ibrahim ibn Ya‘qub ibn Ishaq Jouzjani narrates from Yazid ibn Haroon, from Hammad ibn Salamah, from Ammar ibn Abi Ammar that he said, “Both Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali, and Zaid, the son of Umar died. We shrouded those two and Saeid ibn Aas offered funeral prayer on them with Hasan, Husain and Abu Hurairah praying behind him.”

The twelfth narration

Ibrahim ibn Ya‘qub narrates from Yazid ibn Haroon, he from Ismail ibn Abi Khalid that he said, “Aamir was asked as to how the prayer on the corpses of men and women were offered to which he replied, ‘When I arrived, I saw Abdullah ibn Umar offering funeral prayer on his brother and his mother Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib.’”10

3. Hakim Nishaburi’s Narration in Al-Mustadrak

Hakim, Abu Abdullah Nishaburi (d. 405 A.H.), has narrated only one tradition in this regard as follows:

Hassan ibn Ya‘qub and Ibrahim ibn Ismat, both fair and just, from Sarri ibn Khuzaymah, from Mu‘alla ibn Asad,11 from Wuhaib ibn Khalid, from Ja‘far ibn Muhammad [i.e. Imam Sadiq (a.s.)], from his father, from Ali ibn Hussain, who said, ‘Umar asked Ali for the hand of Umm Kulthum in marriage and said, ‘Marry her to me.’

Ali said, ‘I have kept my daughters for Jafar‘s son.’

Umar said, ‘Marry her to me, for by Allah, there is no man on earth who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve!’

Then Umar came to the Muhajirun and said, ‘Don‘t you congratulate me?’

They asked, ‘With whom are we congratulating you, O Commander of the Faithful?’

He replied, ‘With the daughter of Ali and Fatima, daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S). I head the Messenger of Allah (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.”

I desired to include myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.’

After reporting this narration, Hakim then says, ‘This tradition is authentic in terms of the chain of transmission, but Bukhari and Muslim have not narrated it.’12

4. Bayhaqi’s Narrations in Al-Sunan Al-Kubra

Abu Bakr Bayhaqi (d. 457 A.H.) has reported some narrations in this regard which are as follows.

The first narration

Abu Abdullah, Hafidh (i.e. Hakim, the author of Al-Mustadrak) from Hassan ibn Ya‘qub and Ibrahim ibn Ismat, reports that Sarri ibn Khuzaymah reported from Mu‘alla ibn Asad, he from Wuhaib ibn Khalid who narrated, “Ja‘far ibn Muhammad (i.e.Imam Sadiq (a.s.)) reported from his father, he from Ali ibn Hussain; Likewise from Abul Abbas, Muhammad ibn Ya‘qub, from Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar, from Yunus ibn Bukair, from ibn Ishaq, from Abu Ja‘far (i.e. Imam Baqir (a.s.)), from his father, from Ali ibn Hussain that:

When Umar married Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib, he came to the Muhajirun between the grave (of the Messenger of Allah) and the pulpit where the people in attendance congratulated him and wished him well.

Addressing the people, Umar said, ‘Behold! I swear by Allah that what impelled me to marry her, was a tradition that I had heard from the Messenger of Allah (S) who said:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.”

Having quoted this narration, Bayhaqi says, “This is the text of Ibn Ishaq‘s narration, but it is, in terms of the chain of transmission, considered to be ‘mursal’13 and ‘hasan’ (good). That is because it has also been narrated with a broken chain of transmission.

The second narration

Abu Husain ibn Bishran reported from Da‘laj ibn Ahmad, from Musa ibn Haroon, from Sufyan, from Waki‘

ibn Jarrah, from Rooh ibn Ubadah, from Ibn Jurayj, from Ibn Abi Malikah, from Hasan ibn Hasan and he from his father that he said:

Umar asked Imam Ali for the hand of Bibi Umm Kulthum in marriage. Ali said, 'She is too young to be married.'

Umar said, 'I heard the Prophet of Allah (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

"Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage."

I desired to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.

Ali turned to Hasan and Husain and said, 'Marry Umm Kulthum to your uncle!'

They said, 'Umm Kulthum, like all other women, is free to choose whomever as husband.'

Ali stood up angrily (!) but Hasan pulled his lap and said, 'We cannot afford to miss you.'

Ali said, 'Then marry her to Umar.'14

Bayhaqi has included this narration again under "The Narrations about Fathers Marrying out Their Virgin Daughters."15

Turkmani, the author of the book of Al-Jouhar Al-Naqi, says, "Bayhaqi, in this section of his book, has narrated the marriage of the Prophet and a six-year-old Aisha, the marriage of Umar and Ali's daughter at a young age, and some of the Prophet's companions who married out their young daughters.... As for Aisha and Ali's daughter, they were young (and had not yet reached the age of puberty)."

5. Khatib Baghdadi's Narrations in Tarikh Baghdad

Khatib Baghdadi (d. 463 A.H.) explaining the biography of Ibrahim ibn Mahran Marwazi in his Tarikh Baghdad, narrates a tradition with his chain of transmission. The narration reads: Laith ibn Sa'ad Qaysi, a servant of Bani Rafa'ah in the year 171 AH in Egypt, reports from Musa ibn Ali ibn Rabah Lakhmi, from his father, from Uqba ibn Aamir Juhani, who narrated:

Umar ibn Al-Khattab asked Ali ibn Abi Talib for the hand of Umm Kulthum (daughter of Fatima) in marriage, and frequently visiting Ali's house on this matter. He told Ali, 'O Abul Hassan, what has made me to come to you time and again is a saying which I heard from the Prophet of Allah (S) that:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.”

I wish to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.’

Ali stood up and called for his daughter, made her up (!) and then sent her to Amirul Mu‘meneen, Umar. Seeing Umm Kulthum, Umar stood up and grabbed her ankle and said, 'Tell your father that I am willing, I am willing, I am willing.’

When the girl returned to his father, Ali said, ‘What did Amirul Mu‘meneen say?’

Umm Kulthum said, ‘When Umar saw me, he got up, took me in his lap, kissed me (!), and when I got up to leave, he grabbed my ankle and said, 'Tell your father that I am willing.’

Then Ali married her to Umar. She gave birth to Zaid ibn Umar ibn Khattab who lived until he grew old and died.16

6. Ibn Abd Al-Barr’s Narrations in Al-Isti’ab

Ibn Abd Al-Barr Qurtubi (d. 643 A.H.) has also reported some narrations in this regard which are as follows:

The first narration

Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib, was born before the demise of the Prophet of Allah (S). Her mother was Fatima Zahra, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S). Umar ibn Khattab asked Ali ibn Abi Talib for her hand in marriage.

Ali said, “She is young.’

Umar said, “Marry her to me! I shall observe her dignity more than anyone else.”

Ali said, “I will send her to you, if you like her, I shall marry her to you.”

Ali then sent the girl with a piece of cloth and told her to say [to Umar] 'This is the scarf that I was talking about'. She conveyed these words to Umar, who said, “Tell your father that I have accepted.” Umar then touched the girl's calf pulling aside the garment.17

She exclaimed, 'You have done this to me? If it hadn't been for the fact that you are the Commander of the Faithful, I would have broken your nose'. The girl went home and repeated the episode to her father, stating 'You sent me to a foul man.'

With that Ali said, “My daughter, he is your husband.”

Thereupon, Umar went over to the Muhajirun near the pulpit of the Prophet (S), where the early Muhajirun used to gather. Addressing them, he said, “Congratulate me.”

They said, “What for, O Amirul Mu‘umeneen?”

He said, “I have married Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib. I heard the Prophet of Allah (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’

I was related to the Prophet (S) but I wish to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.”

The Muhajirun congratulated him.

The second narration

Abdul Warith reports from Qasim, from Khushani, from Ibn Abi Umar, from Sufyan, from Amr ibn Dinar, from Muhammad (Ibn Hanafiyah) the son of Ali, who narrates, “Umar ibn Khattab asked Ali for her daughter‘s hand (Umm Kulthum) in marriage. Ali replied that she was too young.

They told Umar, ‘Ali has rejected you.’

Umar returned to Ali to ask again for his daughter‘s hand in marriage.

Ali said, ‘I will send her to you, if you like her, she will be your wife.’

Then Ali sent her daughter to Umar, and Umar pulled away the cloth from her calf (!). Umm Kulthum said, ‘Take off your hands! Were it not for the fact that you are the Commander of the Faithful, I would have blinded you.’

The third narration

Ibn Wahab reports from Abdul Rahman ibn Zaid ibn Aslam, from his father, from his grandfather who narrates that: Umar ibn Khattab married Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib with a dowry of four thousand dirham!

The fourth narration

Abu Umar says: Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib, gave birth to two children named Zaid and Ruqayyah from Umar ibn Khattab. She and her son Zaid died on the same day.

Zaid was injured in a battle which took place overnight among Bani Adi clan. He had gone to settle the dispute between the warring parties when someone hit him in the dark. He got fatally injured and collapsed. A while later he died, his death coinciding with the death of his mother.

Ibn Umar prayed on both of them as suggested by Hasan ibn Ali.

As they say, two traditions were performed about these two people:

None of them inherited from the other, since it was not clear who passed away first.

Zaid's corpse was placed in front of his mother's corpse on the side where the prayer leader stood.1

7. Ibn Athir's Narrations in Usd Al-Ghabah

Ibn Athir Jazari (d. 630 A.H.) has also related some narrations in this regard in his book titled Usd Al-Ghabah. His narrations are as follows:

The first narration

Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib and Fatima, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S) was born before the demise of the Holy Prophet (S).

Umar ibn Khattab asked Ali ibn Abi Talib for his daughter's hand in marriage. Ali replied that she was too young.

Umar said. 'There is no man who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve.'

Ali said, 'I will send her to you and if you are pleased, I shall marry her to you.'

Then Ali sent Umm Kulthum to Umar with a piece of cloth and instructed her to tell Umar that it was the cloth he was talking about.

Umm Kulthum conveyed Umar her father's message. Umar told her, 'I am pleased, may Allah be pleased with you.' He then touched her!

'Why are you doing this?' Umm Kulthum objected. 'Had it not been for the fact that you are Commander of the Faithful, I would have broken your nose.'

Then she went home and repeated the episode to her father, stating 'You sent me to a foul old man.'

With that Ali said, 'My daughter, he is your husband'.

Thereupon, Umar went to the place of the Muhajirun near the pulpit of the Prophet (S), where the early Muhajirun used to gather. He sat beside them and said, ‘Congratulate me.’

They said, ‘What for, O Amirul Mu‘umeneen?’

He said, ‘I have married Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib. I heard the Prophet of Allah (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

‘Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’

I was related to the Prophet (S) but I wish to place myself in the Prophet's lineage through this marriage.

Then the Muhajirun congratulated him.

Umar married Umm Kulthum with a dowry of forty thousand dirhams! The fruit of this marriage was two children named Zaid son of the Greater Umar and Ruqayyah. Umm Kulthum and her son, Zaid, died on the same day.

Zaid was injured in the battle which took place overnight among Bani Adi clan. He had gone to solve the dispute between the two warring sides when someone hit him in the dark. He got fatally injured and collapsed. Zaid was alive for a while but then he breathed his last on the same day as his mother.

Ibn Umar prayed on both of them as proposed by Hasan ibn Ali. When Umar was killed, Awn ibn Ja‘far married Umm Kulthum!

The second narration

Abdul Wahab ibn Ali ibn Ali Amin reports from Abu Fadhl Muhammad ibn Nasir, from Khatib Abu Tahir Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Abi Saqar, from Abul Barakat Ahmad ibn Abdul Wahid ibn Fadhl ibn Nadhif ibn Abdullah Farra who narrates that he told Ahmad:

“Has Abu Muhammad Hassan ibn Rashiq narrated to you?”

He said, “Yes, Abu Bushr Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Hammad Dulabi reported from Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar, from Yunus ibn Bukair, from Ibn Ishaq, from Hasan ibn Hasan ibn Ali ibn Abi Talib who said:

‘When Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib (a.s.) was widowed of Umar, her brothers Hasan and Husain went to her saying:

‘You are known as the chief of Muslim women and the daughter of the best lady. We swear by Allah that if you leave your decision to Ali, he will definitely marry you to one of his orphans (!) and if you wish to get substantial wealth (!!), you will definitely get it.’

I swear by Allah, no sooner did they stand up than Ali arrived while he was leaning on his walking stick. Praising and thanking Allah, he reminded them of their status and dignity to the Prophet of Allah (S) and said: O the children of Fatima, you are aware of your status and dignity and you know well that I have given you priority over my other children owing to your position and relationship to the Messenger of Allah (S).

They said: ‘You are right, may Allah bless you and may He reward you on our behalf.’

Ali turned to his daughter and said: My daughter, Allah has granted you the authority to handle your matter yourself, but I wish you to leave that to me.

Umm Kulthum said: Dear father, I swear by Allah that I am also a woman, and I too have the aspirations of other women (!!), I would love to enjoy the world as much as any other women; I wish to decide for myself what I should do regarding this matter.

Ali said: My daughter, I swear by Allah that it is not your view but it is that of these two!

Then he stood up and said: You will either do this or you will never talk to any of these two!

Hasan and Husain grabbed their father‘s lap and said: Dear father, sit down. By Allah, we cannot afford to miss you. Turning to Umm Kulthum, they said: Leave your matter to him.

‘I have done so,’ Umm Kulthum answered.

Ali said: I will marry you to Awn ibn Ja‘far, who is an adolescent. Thereupon, Ali returned to Umm Kulthum giving her four thousand dirham and sending her to Awn.

This narration has also been reported by Abu Umar.

8. Ibn Hajar’s Narrations in Al-Isabah

Ibn Hajar Asqalani, who died in the year 852 A.H., has also reported some narrations in this regard which are as under:

The first narration

Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib was a descendant of Hashim, her mother was Fatima,

the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (S). She was born during the lifetime of the Prophet of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants.

Abu Umar says, 'She was born before the demise of the Holy Prophet (S).'

Ibn Abi Umar Maqdisi says: 'Sufyan reported from Umar, from Muhammad ibn Ali [Imam Baqir (a.s.)] that he said: Umar ibn Khattab asked Ali for her daughter's hand (Umm Kulthum) in marriage. Ali replied that she was too young.

They told Umar, 'Ali has rejected you.'

Umar returned to Ali to ask again for his daughter's hand in marriage.

Ali said: I will send her to you, if you like her, she will be your wife.

Then Ali sent her daughter to Umar who pulled away the cloth from her calf! Umm Kulthum said: Take off your hands! Were it not for the fact that you are the Commander of the Faithful, I would have blinded you.

The second narration

Ibn Wahab reports from Abdul Rahman Ibn Zaid Ibn Aslam, from his father, from his grandfather who narrates that Umar married Umm Kulthum with a dowry of forty thousand dirham!

The third narration

Zubair says: Umm Kulthum bore two children from Umar by the names of Zaid and Ruqayyah. Umm Kulthum passed away on the same day as her son.

Zaid was injured during the battle that took place amongst Bani Adi, where he had gone to settle the dispute between the warring parties when someone hit him in the dark. He got fatally injured and collapsed. His mother was also sick, and they both died on the same day.

The fourth narration

In his Al-Durriyat Al-Tahirah Abu Bushr Dulabi narrates on the authority of Ibn Ishaq:

Hasan ibn Hasan ibn Ali says: When Umar, the husband of Umm Kulthum died and she was widowed of him, her brothers Hasan and Husain went to her and said to her: If you yourself make your decision and want to get substantial wealth, you shall definitely get it. Then Ali entered the house, thanked and praised Allah and said: My daughter, Allah has granted you the authority to handle your matter yourself, but I wish you leave the matter to me.

Umm Kulthum said: Dear father, I swear by Allah that I am also a woman, and I too have the aspirations

and desires of all other women and I would love to enjoy the world as much as any other women do.

Ali said: My daughter, I swear by Allah that it is not your view but rather that of these two!

Then he stood up and said: You either do this or I will never talk to any of these two!

They surrounded Umm Kulthum and wanted her to accept the proposal.

She accepted and got married to Awn ibn Ja'far.

The fifth narration

Dar Qutni has referred to Umm Kulthum in in Al– Ikhwah and has said:

When Awn died, his brother Muhammad married Umm Kulthum! After a while, Awn too died whereupon his brother Abdullah married her (!) and Umm Kulthum died in Abdullah's house.

Ibn Sa'ad has also reported a narration similar to the above saying at the end: Umm Kulthum used to refer to the incident saying: I feel embarrassed towards Asma bint Umais whose two sons died when they were in my company, and I am worried about the third one.

Umm Kulthum died in Abdullah ibn Ja'far's house and did not bear a child with anyone of them.

The sixth narration

Ibn Sa'ad reports from Anas Ibn Ayadh, from Ja'far ibn Muhammad, from his father who said:

Umar ibn Khattab asked Ali for his daughter's hand in marriage. Ali said: I have kept my daughters for the sons of Ja'far.

Umar said: Marry her to me, for by Allah, there is no man on earth who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve.

Ali said: I have accepted.

Umar went to the place of the Muhajirun and told them: Congratulate me.

They congratulated him, and asked: Whom have you married? He replied: I have married the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib.

Indeed, the Prophet of Allah (S) said:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every means will be cut off and every lineage severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage.’

I had given the Prophet a daughter, but I also loved to (marry a daughter from his family).18

1. In spite of the fact that in Sunni sources the greeting‘ (salawat) after the Holy Prophet‘s name is written incompletely, we, as the Prophet (S) himself recommended, have written it completely.
2. We have used signs of exclamation (!!) in our translation of some of the weird, unthinkable and objectionable passages cited from their sources.
3. Ibn Sa'ad, Al-Tabaqat Al-Kubra vol.8 p.338 (ed. Dar Al-Kotob Al-'Ilmiyyah, Beirut 1990)
4. Some translators have translated this tradition as such: “On the Judgment Day every means will be cut off and every lineage severed except my lineage.”
5. A freed slave is known as ‘Mawla’
6. Al-Tabaqatu Al-Kubra,8/338 – 340.
7. In the printed copy of the book, it has been written in this part of the books as such: There is a word here which is not readable! But the original sentence is this: “No, I swear by Allah! That is not true.”
8. In the printed copy of the book, it has been written as such: There is a word here which is not readable! But in the tradition of Muhibuddin Al-Tabari, there is not any word.
9. From the collection of traditions and the above statement, it is concluded that Hazrat Ali (a.s.) was against this marriage and because of the threats from Umar, Aqil wanted this marriage to take place and his anger too, was because of this.
10. Al-Durriyat Al-Tahirah, 157 – 165.
11. In the text of Al-Mustadrak , it has been recorded as Mu‘alla ibn Rashid which is wrong.
12. Al-Mustadrak, 3/153, Ma"rifat Al-Sahabah (Manaqib Amirul Mu"uminin Ali ibn Abi Talib (peace be upon him), No. 4684).
13. Hurried or a tradition in which the chain of narrators is omitted
14. Al-Sunan Al-Kubra, 7/101 and 102 numbers 13393 and 13394.
15. Al-Sunan Al-Kubra, 7/185 number 13660.
16. Tarikh Baghdad, 6/180.
17. Al-Isti"ab, 4/509 & 510.
18. Al-Isabah, 8/464 and 465.

The narrations that you went through were the most important reports that have been passed on by Sunni Muslims’ most famous books. Some of these narrations relate to the allegation that the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) married his daughter to Umar. Some relate to the marriage of Umm Kulthum after Umar‘s death and others relate to the event of her death and her son.

Based on Sunni Muslims’ rules and principles in the science of hadith (tradition) and relying on the sayings of their scholars in `ilm al-rijal [the science of narrators‘ biographies], if one carefully looks and examines the chains of the transmission of these narrations, he will come to understand that the story in its entirety is baseless and unsubstantiated let alone the relevant details and minor incidents in connection with it?1

Now, before verifying the chains, we shall remind you of a few points concerning these narrations:

The stories that you went through in the previous section have not been reported in the two well-known and respected books, namely Sahih Bukhari and Sahih Muslim. The authors of these two books have

disregarded these narrations, not mentioning them in their books.

These narrations have also not been narrated in the other Sunni books which are widely known as Sihah Sittah. Hence, all the authors of the six so-called authentic books have disregarded these traditions and agreed not to narrate them.

This story has not been related in other hadith books such as Musnad of Ahmad ibn Hanbal. He and a group of his followers maintained that anything that is not recorded in this book – Musnad Ahmad – is not authentic.2

It is worth noting that in many cases and in different topics, Sunnis do not present their arguments with reliance on the narrations which are authentic simply because Bukhari and Muslim have not narrated them in their books or that they have not been recorded in the other Sihah books!

The Focal Point in this Regard

The focal point that can be mentioned in this regard is that this story has been narrated by their narrators from the Shia Imams, the Ahl Al-Bayt (a.s.). The above narrations have been transmitted in the books of Al- Tabaqat of ibn Sa'ad, Al-Mustadrak of Hakim, Al-Sunan Al-Kubra of Bayhaqi and Al-Durriyat Al-Tahirah of Dulabi.

Two points must be noted concerning these narrations.

The first point: Following years of studying and reviewing Sunni Muslims' narrations, we have found out that when Sunnis and the opponents of the Ahl Al-Bayt (a.s.) wanted to relate a narration to the Ahl Al-Bayt (a.s.) which is in no way in harmony with those noble men's opinion and doctrine, they have always embarked on fabricating a narration ascribing it to one of the members of the pure progeny of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his descendants.

When they wanted to find a fault with Allah's Prophet (S) and his noble daughter, Fatima Zahra (S.A) as well as his successor Amirul Mu'meneen Ali (a.s.), they made up a story ascribing a saying to the Ahl Al-Bayt that they said that, for example, Ali (a.s.) sought marriage to the daughter of Abu Jahl. (Refer to the treatise that we have written concerning this subject.)

When they wanted to propagate the prohibition of temporary marriage they made every effort to criticize Ibn Abbas, who until the last moment of his life believed that temporary marriage was lawful. Thus, they forged a narration forbidding the temporary marriage and quoting a saying from Ali rebuking and taunting Ibn Abbas for believing in the permissibility of temporary marriage. They also fabricated traditions quoting them from his sons. (See the research work that we have written concerning this topic.)

When they wanted to fabricate a tradition on the merits of the companions, they made this tradition imputing it Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) that he said that the companions were like stars. (See the book that

we have written concerning this topic.)

Therefore, there is no doubt that the story of Umm Kulthum's marriage to Umar is a fabricated story which has no basis at all.

The second point: The Sunni Muslims have narrated this story from Imam Sadiq (a.s.), from his father as narrated in Ibn Sa'ad's Al-Tabaqat or from Imam Sadiq (a.s.), from his father, from Imam Sajjad (a.s.) as narrated in Al-Mustadrak or from Hasan ibn Hasan as narrated in Al- Durriyat Al-Tahirah or from Hasan ibn Hasan, from his father as narrated by Bayhaqi in his Al-Sunan Al-Kubra.

Therefore, if the Sunni Muslims' aim of quoting these narrations is to base their argument on them to prove their side of the story on the basis of their own standards and principles, then it depends on the authenticity of the narration according to them.

Hence, it is not possible to use the foregoing narrations on the authority of the Ahl Al-Bayt (a.s.) because Ibn Sa'ad, the writer of Al-Tabaqat Al- Kubra has spoken insolently and disrespectfully of Imam Sadiq (a.s.) saying: He has several narrations that cannot be used to argue with since they are weak and unreliable. He was once asked: Did you hear these narrations from your father?

He said: Yes.

He was asked again and he said: I found them in my father's book.3

Likewise, in his Al-Mustadrak, Hakim Nisharburi narrates a tradition from Imam Sajjad (a.s.) on the authority of Imam Sadiq (a.s.) considering it to be authentic. Commenting on that tradition, Dhahabi says: The chain of transmission of this narration is cut off.4

Concerning that narration, Bayhaqi, says: This narration is mursal" (hurried or a tradition in which the chain of narrators is omitted.5

The narration that has been narrated from Hasan ibn Hasan in Al- Durriyat Al-Tahirah, is also similar to this. On top of that, its narrators have been weakened as shall soon be clarified. Certainly, there is no interruption in the narrations transmitted in Bayhaqi's Al-Sunan Al-Kubra from Hasan ibn Hasan, from his father but their chains of transmission lack authenticity and credibility especially because the narrator narrates this tradition from Hasan ibn Hasan ibn Abi Malikah. We shall provide the details soon.

On the other hand, if their aim of relating these narrations is to make Shiites accept them, simply because they have been narrated from the Ahl Al-Bayt (a.s.) through those who narrated traditions from the Holy Messenger of Allah (S), such an effort depends on the fact that the followers of Ahl Al-Bayt (a.s.) should verify and authenticate the transmitters of these narrations according to their own viewpoint, and this is the beginning of the debate between Shi'ism and the Sunnite school.

Hence, the most important narrations which Sunni Muslims have made recourse to and pointed out in

their books are verified and proven be unreliable and unauthentic. (By extension, other relevant narrations would be void and unauthentic).

Notwithstanding this, we shall discuss at length in this regard. To begin with, we shall discuss the chain of the transmission of the narration that has been narrated in Al-Sunan Al-Kubra of Bayhaqi, from Imam Baqir (a.s.) and from his respected father Imam Sajjad (a.s.) and in Al-Isti"ab, from Imam Baqir (a.s.) and in Al-Sunan Al-Kubra from Hasan ibn Hasan. Then we shall study their isnad (documentation) and chains of the transmission of the other narrations so as to draw a conclusion and to expose the opponents by concrete arguments and proofs. On this basis, we say:

Bayhaqi has reported this narration in Al-Sunan Al-Kubra from Hakim Nishaburi, from Imam Baqir (a.s.), from his father Imam Sajjad (a.s.). The point is that Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar is also present in the chain of the transmission of the narration, and we shall now study his biography.

Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar as Seen by Biographers

Some of the comments made by biographers concerning Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar are as follows:

Ibn Abi Hatim says: I have written many narrations reported by Ahmad, but because a lot of people are speaking [highly of] him, I have refrained from narrating them.

Ibn Mu'ein says: He used to lie.

Abu Ahmad Hakim also says about him: Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar is weak according to biographers. That is why Ibn Uqdah has disregarded his narrations.

Ibn Adi also says about him: The people of Iraq unanimously consider him as weak (untrustworthy).6

Yunus ibn Bukair as Seen by Biographers

Yunus ibn Bukair is also in the chain of the transmitters of the narrations. Some biographers' sayings about him are as follows:

Ajuri, from Abi Dawud narrated that Yunus ibn Bukair is not trustworthy according to him. He used to take a clause from Ibn Ishaq's sayings and attach it with the traditions.

Nesai says about him: Yunus is not good in narrating traditions. He has also been reported as having said: Yunus is weak in terms of narrating traditions.

Jowzjani says about Yunus: It is appropriate to look into his work carefully.

Saji says: Ibn Madini never transmitted narrations from Yunus; nevertheless, he is counted among the honest narrators by Sunni Muslims.

Ahmad ibn Hanbal says about him: The people hated and detached themselves from no one as much as they hated and detached themselves from him.

Ibn Abi Shaybah says: He was characterized by weakness

Saji says: Yunus was a truthful person, the only flaw with him was that he used to follow the rulers and he was a follower of the Murji'ah'7 sect.8

Amr ibn Dinar as Seen by Biographers

This narration has also been quoted by Ibn Abd al-Barr and Ibn Hajar on the authority of Imam Baqir (a.s.) with Amr ibn Dinar being present in the chain of the transmission. We have mentioned below comments made by some biographers about him:

Maymuni narrates from Ahmad ibn Hanbal that Amr ibn Dinar is weak in terms of transmitting narrations and that he was a reporter of weak [munkar] traditions.

Ishaq ibn Mansur narrates from Ibn Ma'ein that he is not noteworthy from a biographical perspective. Ya'qub ibn Shaybah has also narrated from Ibn Ma'ein that he said that Amr ibn Dinar is a dhahib Al-hadith.9

Amr ibn Ali says about him: The narrations from Amr are weak in terms of transmission. He narrated munkar10 traditions from Salim, from ibn Umar, from Allah's Messenger (S).

Abu Hatim has narrated the same saying: All of his narrations are denounced.

Abu Zur'ah says about Amr: His narrations are vagarious.

Bukhari says: He is a man who should be looked at with uncertainty and hesitation.

Abu Dawud says about his narrations: They are not noteworthy.

Tirmidhi says: He is not strong in terms of transmitting traditions. Nasai declares his opinion about Amr by saying: He is not reliable since he has narrated denounced traditions from Salim.

Elsewhere, he says: He is weak in terms of transmitting traditions.

Jowzjani and Dar Qutni have made similar remarks about him.

Ibn Hibban says: Whoever looks at his narrations, becomes surprised; he has narrated Mawdu'ah11 traditions from trustworthy narrators.

In the book of Al-Awsat, Bukhari also writes as such about him: His narrations can neither be followed nor can they be considered authentic.

Ibn Ammar Mawseli says about Amr: He is weak in terms of transmitting traditions.

Saji also makes a similar remark saying: He is weak in terms of transmitting traditions for he has narrated denounced traditions from Salim.12

These were some of the remarks made by biographers concerning Amr ibn Dinar. Hence, the conclusion is that the narration which he has transmitted in connection with the subject matter is worthless. What is more, Sufyan ibn Uyainah is also in the chain of these narrators.

Sufyan ibn Uyainah as Seen by Biographers

Bayhaqi has also reported this narration from Hasan ibn Hasan, from his noble father (S). Among the people in the chain of the transmission of the tradition is Sufyan ibn Uyainah. What follows is what some biographers have some commented on him:

Ibn Ammar says: I heard Yahya ibn Saeid Qattan saying: Bear witness that Sufyan ibn Uyainah lost his mind in the year 197 (A.H.). Therefore anyone who heard a narration from him in this year or in the following years, cannot be trusted.

After quoting Ibn Ammar, while answering the question of Dhahabi, Ibn Hajar Asqalani says: This has been reported by Dhahabi only because Ibn Ammar is among the trusted intellectuals. There would be no problem, if Yahya ibn Saeid heard it from a group of pilgrims in that year and testified it simply because he trusted them due to the fact that there were many people who reported the same.

I found a saying from Yahya ibn Saeid that can form a reason why Ibn Ammar narrated from him, concerning Ibn Uyainah. While elaborating on the biography of Ismail ibn Abi Saleh Muadhin, in Tarikh Baghdad, Abu Sa‘ad Sam‘ani narrates, with a strong chain of transmission from Abdul Rahman ibn Bushr ibn Hakam, that he heard Yahya ibn Saeid saying: I told Ibn Uyainah: You have written traditions but when you narrate them these days, you add and omit something from their chains of transmission!’

He said: You should obtain the traditions in the same way as you heard them earlier, because I have become old now.

Abu Mu‘een Razi writes as part of the annotations which he has written on Ahmad ibn Hanbal‘s Al-Iman: Haroon ibn Ma‘aruf told Ahmad: The health condition of Ibn Uyainah had deteriorated during the last moments of his life. Sulayman ibn Harb also told him: Ibn Uyainah has made a lot of mistakes in most of the narrations that he has reported from Ayyub.13

Waki’ bin Jarrah as Seen by Biographers

Another narrator who has transmitted this narration is Waki‘ bin Jarrah. In his Mizan Al-E‟tidal, Dhahabi quotes Ahmad ibn Hanbal about Waki‘ bin Jarrah‘s incredibleness and unreliability as a reporter

because he used to curse the predecessors, drink intoxicants and give false verdicts.[14]

Khatib Baghdadi narrates on the authority of Na‘eem ibn Hammad that he had his dinner – or breakfast – with Waki‘. Waki said: Which one do you like me to bring you, old men‘s special nabiz (wine of raisins or dates) or young men‘s special nabiz?

I said: Do you speak of such things?

He said: I believe this is more halal (permissible) than the Euphrates‘water.[15]

Ibn Hajar reports from Ahmad that Waki‘ has erred in as many as five hundred traditions.[16]

He has reported from Muhammad b. Nasr Marwazi that in the last days of his life, Waki‘ used to narrate traditions from his own mind changing his sentences.[17]

Ibn Juraij as Seen by Biographers

Ibn Juraij too, is one the transmitters of this tradition. Regarding him, Ibn Hajar writes: Malik says: When it comes to narrating a tradition, Ibn Juraij is like someone collecting firewood in the darkness.[18]

Ibn Mu‘een says: The narrations that he has narrated from Zuhri are not worthy of attention.

Ahmad says: When Ibn Juraij says: ‘Someone said,’ and ‘I am reporting,’ he is in fact narrating a denounced [munkar] narration.

Yahya ibn Saeid says: Whenever Ibn Juraij says that someone (or so and so) said, it is like he is speaking out his own mind [he is not reporting from anyone].

Ibn Madini says: I asked Yahya ibn Saeid concerning the narrations reported by Ibn Juraij from Ata Khurasani.

He said: His narrations are weak.

I told Yahya: Ibn Juraij says that Ata Khurasani reported to him. Yahya said: His words are not noteworthy; they are all weak. Ata only has given him a book.

Ibn Hibban says: Ibn Juraij used to practice tadlis[19] (concealing).

Dar Qutni says: Keep away from the concealing and deceit of Ibn Juraij since his tadlis [concealing] is mean.[20]

Concerning Ibn Juraij‘s personality, Dhahabi writes in his Mizan Al– E‟tidal: He used to practice tadlis in narrating traditions.[21]

In this regard, Ibn Hajar says: Ibn Juraij used to practice tadlis in narrating narrations and used to

narrate traditions by way of irsal (the absence of the link between the successor and the Prophet).22

Most importantly, Ahmad ibn Hanbal says about him: Some of the narrations that Ibn Juraij has narrated by way of irsal are forged. It was not important for him as to where he was narrating from.23

Ibn Abi Malikah as Seen by Biographers

His name is Abdullah ibn Ubaidullah and it is enough to say about him being untrustworthy that he was a special muadhin‟ (one who calls people to prayer) and the judge of Ibn Zubair.24

Now we shall once again look back at the tradition and see the narrators in the chain of transmission of the tradition which he has reported.

In the narrations of Ibn Sa‘ad and the narrations that Ibn Hajar has narrated from Ibn Abi Malikah in Al-Isabah, there is Waki‘ bin Jarrah whom we became familiar with through the details provided above.

Husham ibn Sa’ad as Seen by Biographers

One of the narrators is Husham ibn Sa‘ad about whom Dhahabi writes in his Mizan Al-E‟tidal:

Ahmad has said about him: Husham was not a memorizer.25 On the other hand, Yahya ibn Qattan did not narrate from him.

Dhahabi further writes: On another occasion, Ahmad says: There is no sound and authentic tradition among Husham‘s traditions.

Concerning him, Ibn Mu‘een says: His traditions are neither strong nor ignorable.

Nesai has describes him as such: Husham is weak in narrating traditions. In another statement, he says: Husham was not strong in terms of narrating traditions.

Ibn Adi says about him: Although Husham was weak in terms of narrating traditions, they are worth writing down and recording.

Ibn Hajar says about him: Dowri narrated from Ibn Mu‘een that Husham is weak in terms of narrating traditions.

Commenting on him, Abu Hatim also says: The traditions of Husham are recorded but they lack the capacity to be used for argumentation or evidence-based reasoning.

Ibn Sa‘ad says about Husham: He used to narrate a lot of traditions but he was generally considered to be weak; he was inclined towards Shi‘ism.26

Ibn Wahab as Seen by Biographers

Ibn Wahab has appeared in the narration that Ibn Abd al-Barr and Ibn Hajar have narrated with their own isnad[27] from Aslam, the freed slave of Umar. Now, we shall see who he is and what biographers have said about him.

Ibn Wahab is that same Abdullah ibn Wahab Al-Qurashi who is Egyptian by origin but was allied with the Quraish.

Ibn Adi and Dhahabi have recorded his name in Al-Kamil fi Al-Dhu‟afa[28] and Mizan Al-E‟tidal respectively.[29]

Ibn Mu‘een has also said something about him with intent to reproach him.[30]

Ibn Sa‘ad says concerning Ibn Wahab: He used to practice tadlis.[31] That is, he concealed the truth about the isnad of the tradition to create the impression that he heard the hadith in person.

Ahmad ibn Hanbal says about him: The traditions which Ibn Wahab has narrated from Ibn Juraij need to be examined and contemplated upon (for they may not be true).

Confirming what Ahmad ibn Hanbal has said about Ibn Wahab, Abu Awanah says: Ahmad has said the truth, because Ibn Wahab has transmitted reports which none other than him has reported.[32]

Musa ibn Ali Lakhmi as Seen by Biographers

Khatib Baghdadi has reported this narration with his own isnad from Laith ibn Sa‘ad, from Musa ibn Ali ibn Rabah Lakhmi, from his father, from Uqbah ibn Amir Juhani who are all verifiable in terms of trustworthiness and reliability.

According to Suyuti: Musa ibn Lakhmi was the governor of Egypt from 155 until 161 A.H.[33]

Ibn Hajar says about him: Musa took the governorship of Egypt in the year 161 AH.[34]

Sam‘ani says concerning Musa Lakhmi: He was the governor of Egypt.[35]

Ibn Mu‘een has commented on him by saying: Musa is not good in narrating tradition.

Regarding Musa Lakhmi, Ibn Abd al-Barr writes: The narrations that Musa has narrated alone are not strong.[36]

Ali ibn Rabah Lakhmi as Seen by Biographers

Ibn Hajar has studied Ali Lakhmi‘s life and made reference to certain facts about him in his book in which

he writes:

He came to Muawiyah as a representative.

He used to say: I shall not pardon whoever named me Ali‘ because my name is Ulai‘.

He was treated with respect by Abdul Aziz (the son of Marwan and brother of Abdul Malik who was for some time the governor of Egypt) until a time when Abdul Aziz got angry at him and sent him to a battle in Africa. He remained there in Africa until he died.37

Uqbah ibn Amir Juhani as Seen by Biographers

Uqbah has been criticized and considered unreliable by many biographers:

He was one of the governors and agents of Muawiyah ibn Abi Sufyan. Sam‘ani says: Uqbah was present during the conquest of Egypt and he got the measurement of that area. In the year 44, after the death of Utbah son of Abu Sufyan, he served as the commander of Muawiyah‘s army in Egypt. Then in the year 47, Muawiyah dispatched him for a naval combat.38

Ibn Hajar says about Uqbah: He was appointed governor of Egypt by Muawiyah in the year 44.39

Suyuti has also said the same thing about him.40

He was the murderer – or one of the murderers – of Ammar ibn Yasir. In this regard, Ibn Sa‘ad writes: Ammar (may Allah bless him) was killed at the age of 91. He had been born before the Prophet of Allah (S). In the Battle of Siffin, Ammar was confronted by three people; Uqbah ibn Amir Juhani, Umar ibn Harith Khulani and Sharik ibn Salamah Muradi. When they had surrounded him, Ammar told them: I swear by Allah, if you attack me and push us back as far as to Hajar palm grove, I would still be sure that we are on the right side and you are not.

It was then that they attacked and killed him. Some people thought that Uqbah ibn Amir had killed Ammar.

He was the man who bate up Ammar by the order of Uthman.

After the above account of the conversation, Ibn Sa‘ad says: Uqbah is the person who bate Ammar at the behest of Uthman bin Affan.41

Based on the foregoing account, we do not see any need to examine the biographies of Laith bin Sa‘ad and other people in Khatib Baghdadi‘s chain of the transmitters of the narration.

Ata Khurasani as Seen by Biographers

One of the narrators of this narration is Ata Khurasani. Bukhari has mentioned him in the book titled Al-Dhuafa Al-Saghir.42

Ibn Hibban has made mention of him in Al-Majruhin.43 Uqaili has mentioned his name in his book titled Al-Dhuafa Al-Kabir.44

Dhahabi has provided Ata Khurasani's biographical details in two of his books namely Mizan Al-E'tidal and Al-Mughni fi Al-Dhuafa'.45

Sam'ani says about Ata Khurasani: He was a man of bad memory, had a lot of mistakes, erred unknowingly and these narrations were transmitted from him. When these problems were noted with his narrations, they were no longer used as proofs and reasons as they were considered worthless and unacceptable.46

In addition, there is interruption and disconnection with this narration of his because Ata was born in the year 50 and he died in the year 133 or 150 of the Islamic calendar. Therefore he must have narrated these narrations from someone else whose name he has not mentioned.

Muhammad ibn Umar Waqidi as Seen by Biographers

One of the narrators who have reported this narration is Muhammad ibn Umar Waqidi. Biographers have also said a lot about him:

Ahmad ibn Hanbal says: He is a great liar and a person who tampers with narrations.

Bukhari and Abu Hatim say: Muhammad ibn Umar is an obsolete person.

Likewise Abu Hatim and Nesai have said: He used to forge narrations.

Ibn Rahwaih says: In my opinion, he is one of those who fabricated narrations.

Ibn Mu'een says: He is not a reliable and trustworthy person.

Dar Qutni says: He is characterized by weakness in terms of narrating traditions.

Ibn Adi says: Traditions transmitted by him are not protected and coherent; evil and complications arise from them.

Sam'ani says: Much has been said about him.

Ibn Khallakan says: The biographers have weakened him in terms of narrating traditions and they have said a lot concerning him.

Yafe'ei says: Prominent traditionists have labeled him as weak.

Dhahabi says: There is an all-out agreement about disregarding his narrations.[47]

Abdul Rahman ibn Zaid as Seen by Biographers

Another person who has narrated this tradition is Abdul Rahman ibn Zaid. Abu Talib says: Ahmad ibn Hanbal said concerning Abdul Rahman ibn Zaid: He is weak in terms of narrating traditions.

Abdullah ibn Ahmad says: I heard my father disparaging Abdul Rahman and saying: He narrates denounced traditions.

Dowri says: Ibn Mu'een says about Abdul Rahman: His narrations are not noteworthy.

Bukhari and Abu Hatim say about him: Ali ibn Madini has strongly disparaged (weakened) him.

Abu Dawud says: Zaid ibn Aslam's children are all weak in terms of narrating traditions.

Nesai and Abu Zur'ah have said about Abdul Rahman: He is weak in terms of narrating traditions.

Abu Hatim says: Abdul Rahman is not strong in reporting traditions.

Ibn Hibban comments on Abdul Rahman by saying: Owing to ignorance, he used to narrate the traditions inversely to an extent that he narrated a lot of mursal [lit. hurried] traditions as marfu [attributed] traditions and a lot of the mawquf[48] traditions with chains of transmission and it is because of the same reason that his narrations are denounced and disregarded.

Ibn Sa'ad says: He has reported a lot of narrations, but surely he is weak in terms of narrating traditions.

Ibn Khuzaymah says: Abdul Rahman is among the people who are of poor memory due to which the scholars and experts never use his narrations to present their argument.

Saji says: His narrations are munkar [denounced].

Tahawi says: His narrations are weak according to scholars of hadith.

Jowzjani says: Zaid's children are weak in terms of narrating traditions.

Hakim and Abu Na'eim say: Abdul Rahman used to narrate forged traditions from his father.

Ibn Jauzi says: Biographers are unanimous about him being dhaif [weak].[49]

Zaid ibn Aslam as Seen by Biographers

Another narrator of this narration is Zaid ibn Aslam. Biographers have written that he has transmitted narrations from Jabir ibn Abdullah Ansari and Abu Hurairah, while Ibn Mu'een has said: Zaid had never heard any narration from either Jabir or Abu Hurairah.

Thus many narrations reported from other companions have been attributed to him to make the impression that he himself has reported those narrations from them whereas in fact he had never heard them.

Ibn Abd al-Barr has also said the same thing about him and Ibn Hajar has quoted him and seen eye to eye with him in this regard. He says: Ibn Abd al-Barr has said things in the introduction to his book Al-Tamhid which show that Zaid practiced tadlis in narrating traditions.

Moreover, Ibn Umar has been quoted as having said: I do not know any weaknesses in him other than the fact that he interpreted the Quran based on his own personal opinion and he went to extremes in doing this.50

What was said above ignores the biographies of the narrators of this tradition in between Ibn Abd al-Barr, Ibn Hajar and Ibn Wahab.

Zubair ibn Bakkar as Seen by Biographers

Ibn Hajar has reported this narration in his Al-Isabah from Zubair ibn Bakkar. Zubair was the judge of the city of Makkah and was among the people who disobeyed the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) and the Prophet's Household (a.s.) going astray. With that said about him, he has also been disparaged and reproached by Sunnite scholars. Zubair died in the year 256 A.H.

It has been reported from Ibn Abi Hatim that he saw Zubair but he did not write any traditions from him.

Ahmad bin Ali Sulaymani has mentioned Zubair ibn Bakkar in Al- Dhu"afa (a book on weak and unreliable narrators) and has commented on him as such: His narrations are denounced.

In addition, Ibn Hajar's narration from Zubair has been transmitted by way of irsal (the absence of the link between the successor and the Prophet (S)).51

A Study of the Chains of Transmission of Narrations about Umm Kulthum's Marriage to Umar

What has been mentioned had to do with the main story which was, by way of the biographical study, proven to be baseless. Now we shall review the narrations concerning the marriage of Umm Kulthum

after Umar‘s death. Sunni sources have passed on narrations concerning Umm Kulthum‘s life as per which the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) married Umm Kulthum to ‘Awn ibn Ja‘far. The main and original source of this narration is Al-Durriyat Al-Tahirah which other sources such as Usd Al-Ghabah, Al-Isabah, Dhakhair Al-Uqba etc. have cited from.

This narration from Hasan ibn Hasan has been reported through Ahmad ibn Abdul Jabbar, Yunus ibn Bukair and Ibn Ishaq, from Hasan ibn Hasan. Of course we have already examined the chain of the transmission of this narration.

Dulabi has transmitted this narration with his own chain from Ibn Shahab Zuhri, who was among the famous deviants going astray from the path of the Prophet‘s household, peace be upon them.52

In this study, we have skipped the biographies of other narrators and we are just reminding you of one thing and that is, Ibn Muni‘ – who has narrated from Zuhri – was the brother of Husham ibn Abdul Malik‘s wife.53

A Study of the Authenticity of the Narrations Concerning Umm Kulthum’s Death

The narrations which are about Umm Kulthum‘s death have, for the most part, been narrated by Ibn Sa‘ad in his Al-Tabaqat Al-Kubra. We shall now examine their chains of transmission and then their significations.

There is no doubt that most of the chains of the transmitters of this narration end to Amir Shu‘abi. Hence, we shall now explore his personality and try to figure out who he is.

A Look at the Biography of ‘Amir Shu’abi

He was born during the last six years Umar‘s reign. He died after the hundredth hegira year. His narrations are, therefore, mursal (i.e. the chain of narrators is omitted). Shu‘abi was the judge of the Marwan family.

He was amongst the deviants who opposed the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) to the extent that he went to Hajjaj and spoke ill of him (a.s.) and cursed him. Hasan Basri was enraged witnessing this. He advised him not to curse Ali (a.s.).54

His grudge and enmity impelled him to say: ‘Ali had never read the Quran nor had he memorized it!‘ This unconsidered saying made some people oppose him and reject what he had said about Ali (a.s.).55

It was because of this enmity that he was led to fabricate narrations such as the following:

Abu Bakr prayed on Fatima, the daughter of Allah‘s Prophet (S) and recited four takbirs.

When Fatima passed away, Ali buried her at night and took Abu Bakr by his arm helping him to offer prayer on Fatima.

The fact that this narration is fabricated is so obvious that Ibn Hajar has been compelled to write under it: This narration is weak and disconnected.56

Likewise this enmity has made him go as far as to consider Harith Hamedani as a liar (because he was Shiite) but he was objected to for having leveled such an accusation against him.

Ibn Hajar says in this regard: While quoting Ibrahim about Shu'abi refuting Harith, Ibn Abd al-Barr writes in his book titled Al-Ilm: I think Shu'abi should be punished because he has refuted Harith and called him a liar. This is because Harith had not been seen lying, and his only crime was his excessive love of Ali, peace be upon him.57

A Look at the Biography of Ammar ibn Abi Ammar

In view of the fact that some of the narrations end with Ammar ibn Abi Ammar, a quick glimpse into his biographical account reveals that a number of the leaders of Jarh' (lit. to injure) and Ta'dil' (lit. to adjust)58 such as Shu'abah ibn Hajjaj, Bukhari, Ibn Hibban and others have reproached him.59

A Look at the Biography of Nafi'

Some of these narrations are connected to Nafi', the master of Ibn Umar. Hence, we must have a short glimpse of his biography. To understand the type of his character, it is enough to know that Abdullah ibn Umar had said to Nafi':

'Oh Nafi' fear Allah and do not ascribe lies to me in the same way as Ikramah used to ascribe lies to Ibn Abbas.'

This saying of Ibn Umar about Nafi' and Ikramah, is famous. Additionally, Ahmad ibn Hanbal's saying about Nafi' is worthy of notice. He says: Nafi's narrations from Umar are cut-off and disconnected.60

A Look at the Biography of Abdullah Al-Bahi

Some of these narrations are connected to Abdullah Al-Bahi who is better known as Abdullah ibn Yasar.

Concerning him Ibn Hajar says: Abdullah was the master Mus'ab ibn Zubair, therefore, his narrations are mursal' (incompletely transmitted).

Whenever this man narrates from Aisha, he says, 'Aisha narrated to me.' The scholars have refuted him and said that he narrates only from Urwah ibn Zubair.

Ibn Abi Hatim has also made mention of Abdullah Al-Bahi in his Kitab Al-Ilal reporting from his father

that argument cannot be built on Al- Bahi‘s narrations as they are disordered and shaky.61

What has so far been said was about the chains of the transmitters and documentation of the narrations regarding Umm Kulthum.

Of course, we have, for the sake of brevity, closed eyes to biographies of other individuals who have transmitted this narration.

1. We can divide the narrators of these narrations into two groups: People who have been weakened (considered as unreliable) and accused of lying by Sunni scholars; People who are though trusted by Sunni scholars, their hatred and malice towards the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) was an obvious and indisputable historical reality. It is pertinent to mention that, the narrations from this group of narrators – especially those against Ali bin Abi Talib (a.s.) – are not acceptable to Shia.
2. Vide: Nafaht Al- Azhar, 2/27 and next.
3. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 2/94.
4. Talkhis Al-Mustadrak, 3/142.
5. Al-Sunan Al-Kubra, 7/102.
6. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 1/47.
7. Murji‘ah was a group of Muslims who proclaimed: "No sin is harmful with faith
8. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 11/383.
9. Meaning the traditions transmitted by him are worthless.
10. Munkar literally means 'denounced'. If a narration which goes against another authentic hadith is reported by a weak narrator, it is known as munkar.
11. Hadith Mawdu', a tradition fabricated by the narrator and falsely ascribed to Prophet Muhammad (S) or his descendants, peace be upon them.
12. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 8/27.
13. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib: 4/108 and 109.
14. Mizan Al-E‘tidal, 7/127.
15. Tarikh Baghdad, 13/477.
16. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 11/111.
17. Ibid, 11/114.
18. This phrase is used in scientific books to make a sarcastic remark about mixing up of the right and wrong and truth and falsehood.
19. A person reports from his shaikh whom he met, what he did not hear from him, or from a contemporary of his whom he did not meet, in such a way as to create the impression that he heard the hadith in person. A mudallis (one who practices tadlis) here usually uses the mode ("on the authority of") or ("he said") to conceal the truth about the isnad.
20. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 6/354 and 355.
21. Mizan Al-E‟tidal, 4/404.
22. Taqrib Al-Tahdhib,1/617.
23. Mizan Al-E‟tidal, 4/404.
24. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 5/272.
25. According to some scholars, a memorizer in the science of diraya (biography) and traditions is said to be a person who has memorized one hundred traditions together with their chains of transmission.
26. Dhahabi adds: "Ibn Abd al-Barr has mentioned his name among the people who are counted as weak but whose narrations are written, and Ya‘qub ibn Sufyan has also considered him to be among the weak.
27. The chain of authorities attesting to the historical authenticity of a particular hadith.
28. Al-Kamil fi Al-Dhu‟afa: 5/336.
29. Mizan Al-E’tidal, 4/223.

30. Al-Kamil fi Al-Dhu'afa, 5/336 and 337 and Mizan Al-E'tidal: 4/223 and 224.
31. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 6/67 and 68.
32. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 6/67 and 68.
33. Husn Al-Muhadharah, 2/12.
34. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 10/323.
35. A-Ansab 5/134.
36. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 10/323.
37. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 7/271 and 272.
38. Al-Ansab, 2/134.
39. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 7/209 and 210.
40. Husn Al- Muhadharah, 2/8.
41. Al-Tabaqat Al-Kubra, 3/196.
42. Al- Dhuafa Al-Saghir, 178 and 179.
43. The book of Al-Majruhin, 2/130 and 131.
44. Al-Dhuafa Al-Kabir, 3/405.
45. Mizan Al-E"tidal, 5/92, Al-Mughni fi Al-Dhuafa, 2/59.
46. Al-Ansab, 2/337.
47. See: Mizan Al-E'tidal, 6/273, Al-Mughni fi Al-Dhuafa, 2/354, Al-Kashif, 3/65, Mir'at) Al-Jinan, 2/36 in the happenings of the year 207, Al-Ansab, 5/567, Taqrib Al-Tahdhib, 2/117 and Tabaqat Al- Hifadh (page 81), 149 and other sources.
48. Mawquf refers to a narration attributed to a Companion, whether a statement of that companion, an action or otherwise."
49. You can find this matter and other sayings in the book of Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 6/162 and 163.
50. You can find these statements and also other sayings in Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib volume 6 pages 162 and 163.
51. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 3/278.
52. Refer to the treatise I have written concerning the narration about Ali's proposal to Abu Jahl's daughter.
53. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 7/13.
54. Ihya Al- Ulum, 2/346.
55. Ghayat Al-Nihaya fi Tabaqat Al-Qura", 1/541.
56. Al- Isabah, 8/267.
57. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 2/135.
58. The phrase Al-jarh wa Al-ta'dil refers to a systematic approach to critiquing a narrator's position as a narrator.
59. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 7/341, Taqrib Al-Tahdhib, 1/707.
60. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 10/370.
61. Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib, 6/82 and 83.

Truth-seeker! Come with me so we may, after we have examined the biographies of the narrators of this story, look into the text of the narrations and their significations. This has to be done so that we should, throughout the stages of the story, look from close the malevolence and spiteful behaviors of the enemies of the household of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon them.

We shall carry on this discussion from several dimensions.

The first dimension

In the concocted story about Umm Kulthum's marriage to Umar, it has been narrated that the reason given by Imam Ali (a.s.) for not consenting to his daughter's marriage to Umar was the former's young

age and that he had kept her for the son of his brother, Ja'far ibn Abi Talib.

It has been narrated in the narration by Ibn Sa'ad that Ali (a.s.) said: I have kept my daughters for the sons of Ja'far.

In the narration of Hakim, the Imam has been quoted as having said: I have prepared her for the son of my brother.

In another narration quoted by Ibn Sa'ad, it is reported that the Imam said: She is a young girl.

Of course Ibn Abd al-Barr, Ibn Athir and others have also reported the same thing. In Bayhaqi's narration, it has been reported that the Imam (a.s.) said: She is too young (for marriage).

So in these narrations, nothing else has been reported from the Imam (a.s.), except that Umar returned again and said: Marry her to me; I swear by Allah! There is no one in this world that....

According to these narrations, the Imam (a.s.) did not do anything except that he sent her daughter to Umar so that he could see her....!

It has been added in some narration that the Imam (a.s.) ordered her to be prepared and made-up. So that she was beautified and adorned and then, the Imam (a.s.) sent her to Umar so that if he liked her and agreed to marry, she would then become his wife!

It is surprising to see how the Imam's position changes in respect of Umm Kulthum's marriage from total and decisive refusal to quick acceptance, thus reversing and changing his mind so quickly?

Who believes this? At least this report is dubious and suspicious and requires some thought and reflection. Certain facts are revealed to the reader who goes through different narrations in this regard, facts that they have attempted to continue to hide in some old works authored by the scholars of hadith. Now we shall mention and elaborate on some of those narrations:

Ibn Maghazali (d. 483) narrates through his own chain from Abdullah ibn Umar that Umar ibn Khattab mounted the pulpit and said: Oh people! I swear by Allah! What made me talk persistently to Ali ibn Abi Talib concerning his daughter was the fact that I heard the Prophet of Allah (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع (يوم القيامة) إلا سببي وصهري فإنهما يأتيان يوم القيامة يشفعان لصاحبهما

"Every lineage and means and grooming relationship will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage and grooming relationship with me, and these two will come on the Day of Judgment and will intercede for their owners."1

Through this narration, it becomes clear that the Companions and their followers were surprised hearing this story and it was even talked about in the city making Umar to go on the pulpit and explain to the public his aim of this marriage proposal, and he swore that he had no other reason for this act of his except that he had heard the Messenger of Allah (S) about it and he was bent on doing that only for the same reason.

The point to be taken into consideration is that there is no detail as to Umar‘s persistence and insistence and it has not been explained why he insisted on marrying Ali‘s daughter and what the latter‘s reaction was to it.

In Khatib Baghdadi‘s narration, it has been reported that Umar ibn Khattab proposed to Ali ibn Abi Talib for his daughter, who was from Fatima (a.s.), and went to him time and again and said: O Abal Hassan, What has made me to come to you time and again is only a saying that I heard from the Messenger of Allah (a.s.) ….

It has been stated, in this narration, that Umar visited Ali (a.s.) many a time.

According to some narrations, Umar used threat to intimidate Ali (a.s.) in order to make him accept the offer. For instance, Ibn Sa‘ad reports:

When Imam Ali (a.s.) told Umar that Umm Kulthum was a young girl, Umar said: I swear by Allah! That is not your excuse, but we know what your intent is.

In the narration reported by Dulabi and Muhib Tabari from Ibn Ishaq, it has been said that Umar said: I swear by Allah! That is not what you want to do, it is only that you want to stop me from marrying Umm Kulthum.2

In some other narrations it has been clearly stated that Umar‘s whip also played an important role in this incident. In the narration that Dulabi has narrated through his own chain from Aslam, Umar‘s master, we read: Umar proposed to Ali ibn Abi Talib for his daughter, Umm Kulthum, and he discussed the matter with Abbas, Aqil and Hasan.

Aqil got angry and told Ali: The passage of days and months will only add to your lack of insight and astuteness in your work. By Allah, if you do this, such and such will happen.

Ali told Abbas: By Allah! He is not talking wishfully, but the whip of Umar has impelled him to say what you are hearing.3

On the other part, Abu Na‘eim Isfahani has also passed this report from Zaid ibn Aslam, from his father, but he has omitted Umar‘s whip from the report. Let‘s read this narration together:

Zaid ibn Aslam narrates from his father that Umar ibn Khattab called Ali ibn Abi Talib to his place and had a private conversation with him. Thereupon, Ali stood up and walked up to sufah4 and consulted

Abbas, Aqil and Hasan regarding Umm Kulthum's marriage to Umar.

Ali Said: Umar has informed me that he heard the Prophet of Allah (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

"Every means and lineage is severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage and means."5

Apart from being an underage girl and the fact that Umm Kulthum had been kept for the son of Ja'far, Ali (a.s.) also gave another reason for his refusal where the Imam (a.s.) said: She has also two other guardians apart from me.6

What the Imam (a.s.) meant by those two were Imam Hasan and Hussain (a.s.). According to the narrations, Ali discussed the matter with Hasan and Hussain (a.s.), Aqil and Abbas.

This narration that has been reported from Aslam implies that Imam Hasan (a.s.) kept silent about this proposal, and his silence has been taken as a sign of his consent and approval.

In another narration it is reported that Hussain kept quiet and Hasan started to talk. Thanking and praising Allah he said: Dear father, apart from Umar, who else is more appropriate for marriage with Umm Kulthum? He was a companion of the Prophet of Allah (S) and when the Prophet (S) passed away, he was pleased with him. He has taken the caliphate and has acted justly!

Ali said: You are right, my son, but I did not want to finish a task without seeking the opinion of you two.7

This narration contradicts the narration that Bayhaqi has reported from Ibn Abi Malikah, from Hasan ibn Hasan. It is reported in that narration that Ali told Hasan and Hussain: Marry her to your uncle.

They said: She is also like all other women and has the right to choose. Thereupon, Ali stood up angrily but Hassan grabbed his cloth and said: Dear father, we cannot afford to miss you.

Ali said: Then marry her to Umar.8

Nevertheless, a group of people have intentionally and knowingly paid heed to these forged narrations. Now, you should give careful attention to the narrations. This same contradiction has been reported from Hasan ibn Hassan in connection with the marriage of Umm Kulthum with Awn ibn Ja'far. In that narration, it is reported that when Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib became a widow after the death of Umar ibn Khattab, her brothers Hasan and Hussain, came over to her and said....9

This is a long narration that contains shameful lies and laughable statements.

The second dimension

It has been stated before that as per many narrations the reason Imam Ali (a.s.) opposed to Umm Kulthum's marriage to Umar was the fact that she was young and underage. It is inferred from these narrations that Umar did not accept what Ali (a.s.) put forth as excuse. That was why he went to Ali time and again persistently asking him for his daughter‘s hand in marriage. He went as far as to use threat to intimidate Ali (a.s.) to accept the proposal as evidenced by narrations reported by Dulabi and Muhib Tabari.

Ali said: "She is young."

Umar said: “I swear by Allah! That is not what you want to do, it is only that you want to stop me from marrying Umm Kulthum. If what you say is the case, send her to me..."10

Since such actions are not in keeping with the reverence and respect of the second caliph according to Sunni scholars, some narrators and hadith experts have avoided to report on the opposition of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) to his daughter's marriage to Umar and also the latter's insistence, threat and refutation. One who refers to Khatib Baghdadi's narration will readily admit this fact.

Third dimension

Ibn Sa‘ad narrates from Waqidi and others and says: Then Ali requested for a piece of garment which he folded and told Umm Kulthum to take it to Umar.

It has been stated in Muhib Tabari‘s report from Ibn Ishaq that Ali called Umm Kulthum, gave her a piece of cloth and told her: Take this to Umar…

This was done to make Umar see her. That was why when Umm Kulthum returned to her father, she said: Umar did not unfold the cloth and he did not look at anything except me.

Surely, such a behavior from the Muslim‘s caliph has been seen by some Sunni scholars e.g. Sabt ibn Jauzi, as filthy and unpleasant. We shall soon point out his words in this regard. It is for the same reason that some narrators have not made reference to this topic in their narrations.

Abu Bushr Dulabi has narrated as such: Ali called Umm Kulthum, who was a little girl, and said to her: Go to Amirul Mu‘meneen and tell him: My father sent you his greetings and said that he fulfilled the request that you had made.

Khatib Baghdadi has also reported a similar narration: Umar proposed to Ali for his daughter‘s hand in marriage and said: Marry her to me.

Ali said: I have kept her for the son of my brother, Abdullah ibn Ja‘far.

Umar said: I swear by Allah, there is no man on the face of the earth who seeks to achieve through her good companionship that which I seek to achieve.

Thereupon, Ali married her to Umar and the latter went to the Muhajireen.

The Fourth dimension

In this story, filthy and unpalatable things have been quoted including the following:

Ibn Sa'ad narrates from Ibn Waqidi as such: Ali ordered Umm Kulthum to be made up and adorned so that she could go to Umar. She was prepared and adorned (as ordered by her father).

In the narration transmitted by Khatib Baghdadi from Uqbah bin Aamir, it has been reported: She was adorned.

In the narration reported from Imam Baqir (a.s.) by Ibn Abd al-Barr and others, the Imam has been quoted as having said: When Umm Kulthum went to Umar, Umar pulled away the cloth from the calf of her leg!

Truly, these reports are at the highest level of obscenity. The question is that, are the liars and forgers of these narrations not ashamed of doing such obscene and loathsome acts? Their conducts are so mean and despicable that even if a lay person hears them, he will readily despise them and testify to their obscenity. Are they not ashamed of forging and attributing such filthy stories to Imam Baqir, peace be upon him?

Indeed it is so shameless and it is owing to the same reason that we see some Sunni narrators trying to misreport and concoct such stories in order to prove their side of the story. Ibn Athir modifies the story and makes it look a bit modest. He says: Umar placed his hand on her.

In this respect, Dulabi and Muhib Tabari have reported as such: Umar took hold of her arm.

Elsewhere they say: Umar grabbed her and pulled her to his bosom! Others such as Bayhaqi and Hakim Nishaburi have not narrated anything in this regard. When reporting such narrations, Muhib Tabari says: Ibn Samman has made a brief but implicit reference to this subject. However, what he has reported does not include anything from the reports transmitted by the narrators whose names were mentioned above.11

In addition, some of the narrators of this story, have stated clearly that this story is a lie. Concerning this same issue, Sabt ibn Jauzi (d. 654) says:

My grandfather writes in Al-Muntazam that Ali sent Umm Kulthum to Umar so that he could see her. Umar pulled away the cloth from the calf of her leg and then touched her!

Sabt ibn Jauzi further says: In my opinion – I swear by Allah – this is a despicable act; even if she were a slave girl, she would not have been treated as such.12

On the other hand, Muslims are unanimous about touching a non– mahram lady being prohibited in Islam. The question is: Why are they attributing all this to Umar?13

The author says: "I wish it was only touching. In Khatib Baghdadi's narration, Umar is said to have even kissed and grabbed the calf of Umm Kulthum's leg!

The fifth dimension

The text of the narration narrated by Ibn Sa'ad and others, in a way, contains praise and congratulation. We have read that Umar told Meccan migrants: Congratulate me and they congratulated him.14 In other words, Umar requested a special congratulation and said: "Congratulate me on wives being considerate and empathetic and on having more children.15

It is pretty obvious that this kind of congratulation was customary in the period of ignorance which, according to all Muslims, the Messenger of Allah (S) had prohibited. In this regard, Ahmad ibn Hanbal narrates through his own chain that Abdullah ibn Muhammad ibn Aqil says: "Aqil son of Talib had married, he came to us and we congratulated him in the way which was customary during the period of ignorance. Aqil said: "Calm down! Do not congratulate me in such a manner because the Prophet of Allah (S) prohibited us from congratulating in such a manner and he said:

You should say "May Allah bless you, may Allah make it blessed, may it be blessed.16

Since this statement of Umar depicts his ignorance and a lack of knowledge about the things that the Messenger of Allah (S) prohibited as well as indicates the fact that he wanted to revive the customs and norms of the period of ignorance, some Sunni scholars have endeavored to alter the text and manipulate it in a way which is consistent with their own values and standards. That is why in Hakim's Al–Mustadrak, we read: Umar went to the Muhajirin and said: Will you not congratulate me?

In Bayhaqi's Al–Sunan Al–Kubra, it is reported that Umar went to the Muhajirin and they prayed and wished him well. Let's not forget that Khatib Baghdadi has never narrated this incident in his Tarikh (history book).

The sixth dimension

Another aspect of this story that can be studied and examined is the fruit of this false marriage; it has been reported in some narrations that following the marriage of Umm Kulthum to Umar, she gave birth to a son allegedly named Zaid. It has been reported by Sa'ad and other narrators that she gave birth to bin Umar and Roqayyah, daughter of Umar.

When it comes to the number of Umar's children, Nawavi narrates as such: "Fatima and Zaid whose mother was Umm Kulthum..."[17]

In another narration passed on by Ibn Qutaibah about the daughters of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali, peace be upon him, it has been stated as such: "Umm Kulthum gave birth to children whom I referred to."[18]

The seventh dimension

One of the topics discussible in this fabricated story is Umm Kulthum's marriage after Umar; it has been mentioned in many a number of narrations that after Umar's death, Awn followed by Muhammad sons of Ja'far married Umm Kulthum but the same people who have reported that these two married Umm Kulthum have said: "Awn and Muhammad were killed in the battle of Shushtar which took place during Umar's caliphate."

Ibn Abd Al-Barr says: "Awn son of Ja'far bin Abi Talib was born in the time of the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants.

Awn's mother and that of his brothers Abdullah and Muhammad sons of Ja'far bin Abi Talib was Asma daughter of Umais Khath'ami. Awn and his brother, Muhammad, were martyred in the battle of Shushtar without them leaving any children behind."[19]

He further says: Muhammad bin Ja'far bin Abi Talib was born in the time of the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants. He is the one who, after the death of Umar bin Khattab, married Umm Kulthum daughter of Ali bin Abi Talib... and was martyred in the battle of Shushtar.[20]

Concerning Awn bin Ja'far's martyrdom, Ibn Hajar says, "Awn bin Ja'far was martyred in the battle of Shushtar which took place in the time of Umar's caliphate. He did not have a child."[21]

Ibn Athir has made a similar comment.[22]

It is pertinent to mention that the battle took place during the caliphate of Umar and historians have made clear reference to it in their accounts.[23]

In this passage quoted from Ibn Hajar, he has made mention of the same fact. Indeed, a truth-seeking researcher is amazedly mindful of the contradictory reports and narrations transmitted by these people.

The eighth dimension

An important question in connection with the topic under discussion is: Which one of the two brothers married Umm Kulthum, Awn bin Ja'far or Muhammad bin Ja'far? Sunni traditions provide different accounts in this regard. Ibn Sa'ad and Dar Qutni, as stated in Al-Isabah, says: "Awn died during the

lifetime of Umm Kulthum and his brother, Muhammad, contracted marriage with her. Then, Muhammad died and Abdullah married her."

Ibn Sa‘ad narrates as such: Umm Kulthum said: I feel embarrassed towards Asma bint Umais whose two sons died when they were with me, and I am worried about the third one! Umm Kulthum died when she was with Abdullah ibn Ja‘far.24

Ibn Qutaibah narrates this story differently; he says: When Umar was killed, Muhammad ibn Ja‘far married Umm Kulthum and died during her lifetime. Then Awn ibn Ja‘far married her and Umm Kulthum died when she was married to him.25

You can see that Ibn Qutaibah has mentioned the marriage of Muhammad ibn Ja‘far with Umm Kulthum before the latter‘s marriage to Awn ibn Ja‘far and she died when she was still married to Awn. Qutaibah has made no mention of Abdullah bin Ja‘far.

Moreover, although Ibn Abd al-Barr has discussed Umm Kulthum‘s life, he has not stated anything regarding her marriage after Umar‘s death, nor has he said anything about her marriage to Awn. Nevertheless, when it comes to Muhammad bin Ja‘far‘s life, he says: Muhammad ibn Ja‘far ibn Abi Talib is the one who married Umm Kulthum, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib, after the death of Umar ibn Khattab.26

The ninth dimension

In this section, we shall now have a short look at the biography of Abdullah ibn Ja‘far. He was the husband of the Wise Woman of Bani Hashim, e.g. Zainab, the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.). Lady Zainab (S.A) used to live with her husband Abdullah until his death after the tragedy of Karbala.

Concerning Zainab (a.s.), Ibn Sa‘ad writes: Zainab was the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib. Abdullah ibn Ja‘far ibn Abi Talib married her. They were blessed with four sons namely; Ali, Awn Akbar, Abbas and Muhammad and a daughter named Umm Kulthum.

Ibn Sa‘ad goes on to report a narration from Muhammad ibn Ismail ibn Fadik, he from Ibn Abi Ze‘b that he said: Abdul Rahman ibn Mahran told me as such: Abdullah ibn Ja‘far ibn Abi Talib, married Zainab the daughter of Ali. At the same time he had married Ali‘s widow, Laila Bint Mas‘ud; both Zainab and Laila were his wives.27

After counting the number of Abdullah‘s children, Nawavi says: Their mother was Zainab, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib from Fatima, the daughter of the Prophet of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants.28

Concerning Hazrat Zainab (a.s.), Ibn Hajar writes: Zainab was the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib ibn Abdul

Muttalib. She was Hashemi and the granddaughter of the Messenger of Allah (S) and her mother was Fatima.

He further writes: Ibn Athir describes Zainab as such: She was born during the lifetime of the Messenger of Allah (S). She was an intelligent and a learned woman as well as a great orator. Her father married her to the son of his brother, Abdullah ibn Ja'far whereupon they were blessed with children. When her brother Imam Husain (a.s.) was killed, she was in his company but thereupon she was taken to Sham (Syria). She was present in the court of Yazid son of Muawiyah. While in the court, a man from Sham wanted to take her sister Fatima as a slave. Addressing Yazid, Zainab delivered a speech that showed her intelligence and strong heart. This story is well-known.29

Therefore, if the woman who was called Umm Kulthum and who died during the reign of Muawiyah is the very daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) and she Abdullah ibn Ja'far's wife after the death of Awn and Muhammad (as also reported in the narrations), then it implies that Abdullah ibn Ja'far married two sisters at the same time, something which is prohibited and obscene in Islam.

That is why Ibn Sa'ad has carefully reported saying: Umm Kulthum was married to Muhammad ibn J'afar. After his death, his brother Abdullah ibn Ja'far ibn Abi Talib married her following the death of her sister, Zainab.

The tenth dimension

Another question that comes up is, who prayed on Umm Kulthum after she died? The answer to this question is found in the reported narrations, but there are contradictions and discrepancies in those reports. The contradictions are found even in the narrations reported by one narrator.

When it comes to the prayer on Umm Kulthum and her son Zaid, Ibn Sa'ad narrates from Shu'abi and Abdullah Al-Bahi as such: Ibn Umar prayed on them.

He has also reported the same story from Ammar bin Abi Ammar and Nafi' who said: Saeid bin Aas prayed on them.

It is interesting to note that some historiographers have narrated from Ammar ibn Abi Ammar that Sa'ad ibn Abi Waqas prayed on them.30

In any case, regardless of who offered the funeral prayer, the narrations indicate the fact that she died during the reign of Muawiyah because the narrations report that Imam Hasan and Imam Hussain (a.s.) attended the prayer.

However, what is proven through historical accounts is that Umm Kulthum and her sister Zainab (a.s.) were present in the event of Karbala. When they were taken to Kufah as slaves, she delivered a famous speech in that city the text of which has been recorded and narrated in many books.

Ibn Taifur (d. 280) has narrated Umm Kulthum's speech in the book of Balaghat Al-Nesa. Ibn Athir and a few other famous scholars and traditionists have also mentioned it under the term "farth" in their books such as Al-Nihayah, Lisan Al-Arab and Taj Al-Arus.

Perhaps it is because of the same reason that in Abu Dawud's narration from Ammar ibn Abi Ammar, it is reported that Ammar ibn Abi Ammar said: "I was present in the funeral prayer on Umm Kulthum and her son. Her son's corpse was placed on the side where the Imam was standing to which I objected but Ibn Abbas, Abu Saeid Khedri, Abu Qutadah and Abu Hurairah were also in attendance. They said that the way they placed the corpses in front of the prayer leader was customary.1

Ammar ibn Abi Ammar ends the story without mentioning the name of the Imam who prayed on those two. Likewise, he has not clarified as to who Umm Kulthum and her son were.

It has been reported again in Nesai's narrations from Ammar ibn Abi Ammar that he said: I was attending the funeral prayer of a lady and a son. The corpse of the son was placed in front on the side at which the Imam was standing and that of the lady was placed behind him when the prayer on those two was offered. Among the people in attendance were Abu Saeid, Ibn Abbas, Qutadah and Abu Hurairah. I objected to the way they had positioned the corpses and they said that it was customary.31

Here Ammar ibn Abi Ammar has only reported that tradition and he has failed to mention the Imam's name, and those of the two dead bodies on which prayer was offered nor has he stated anything about the relation between the woman and the boy.

Summary

As you noticed, we presented and examined the chains of the transmission of the narrations about the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) marrying his daughter to Umar ibn Khattab, and other narrations pertaining to this great lady of the Household of the Prophet (S). However, we could not find in them a chain of transmission that could be relied upon or which an argument could be based upon. We also investigated meticulously the text of the narration regarding Umm Kulthum's marriage to Umar. We looked carefully into the sayings of Sunni scholars and their reports on this topic. We found out that their reports are contradictory and refuting each other.

Moreover, we also studied the significations of the narration and it was made clear that the entire story is baseless and undocumented. The probability here is that the forgers of this story sought to create a virtue for Umar ibn Khattab who himself is one of the narrators of this prophetic tradition:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every means and lineage will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and my lineage.”

This tradition signifies the virtues and merits of the Prophet‘s Household especially the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.). As also stated by Manawi, even Hakim Nishaburi has narrated the above tradition as a proof of the virtues of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.).32 That was why they forged the story of Umar‘s proposal to the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) in a bid to include Umar amongst those who were linked to the Prophet (S) and to finally establish a virtue for him. This is further evidenced by the fact that a number of great Sunni traditionists have reported this tradition from Umar without mentioning this story, and they have reported the same tradition from other individuals without making reference to Umar‘s marriage proposal and the relevant story.

Muttaqi Hindi has cited this tradition from different sources. As per his report, the Messenger of Allah (a.s.) said:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every means and lineage will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and my lineage.”

However, he writes under the tradition as such: Khatib Baghdadi and Hakim Nishaburi have narrated this tradition from Umar. Likewise, Khatib Baghdadi has narrated from Ibn Abbas and Miswar. He further says that Ibn Asakir has also narrated from Ibn Umar that the Prophet of Allah, peace be upon him and his descendants, said:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every lineage and grooming relation will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my lineage and grooming relation.”33

Ibn Maghazali has reported this tradition in Manaqib Al-Imam Ali ibn Abi Talib (a.s.) that the Prophet of Allah (S) said:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

“Every means and lineage will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and my lineage.”

Then he narrates this tradition through his own chain from Saeid ibn Jubair, from Ibn Abbas, from

Umar.34

There is a narration similar to this one reported from the Holy Prophet (S) about Fatima's position and rank. He has been quoted as having said:

فاطمة بضعة مني

"Fatima is a part of my body..."

The Holy Prophet (S) has been quoted by different companions to have said the above on a number of occasions. When some enemies of the Prophet's Household (a.s.) saw the different aspects and implications of this sound and authentic tradition which has been recorded in their own Sihah, they deliberately embarked on fabricating the story of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) making a marriage proposal to Abu Jahl's daughter, something which they linked to the above tradition to prove their own side of the story.35 Thus, both of the traditions relate to marriage proposals, one of them about Umar asking the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) for her hand in marriage and the other is about Ali (a.s.) proposing marriage to Abu Jahl's daughter!

Umar's marriage to Umm Kulthum would make him a groom of Fatima Zahra (S.A) while Ali's marriage to Abu Jahl's daughter would hurt Fatima and injure her feeling! As stated earlier, Umar's proposal was owing to the fact that he had heard the Prophet of Allah (S) say:

كل سبب ونسب منقطع يوم القيامة إلا سببي ونسبي

"Every means and lineage will be severed on the Day of Judgment except my means and my lineage."

Ali's proposal was opposed by the Messenger of Allah (S) and he was offended to the extent that he, peace be upon him, wanted Ali to divorce his daughter!

In short, given the outcome of the research conducted into this story, it is very clear that the entire story is fabricated and outrageous.

When it comes to the narrators of this story, they are Umar's slave, Qadhi ibn Zubair, the killer of Ammar Yasir and the clerics who were affiliated to the Ummayad family.

The narrators in the chain of transmission are a few liars, fabricators, weak and mudallis (one who practices tadlis) in terms reporting traditions.

Most probably, the main reason for fabricating this story is what we just mentioned as evidenced by the

fact that some of the narrators are involved in the transmission of both of the stories.

One Question

Based on what was said, a question arises as to whether or not there is any probability or an occasion to which the narrations regarding this story could be applied after assuming their authenticity and the reliability of the chains of their transmission notwithstanding the fact that this story is famous among Sunni Muslims and there are few shadh (irregular) narrations reported in this connection through Shiite channels as well.

Answer

In reply to this question, we must say that there is no doubt that the statements and narrations reported in this regard contain allegations and claims which are not permissible to accept under any circumstances. For instance, go through the following narration that they have related:

Ali sent Umm Kulthum to Umar so that he could see her. He also ordered that she be adorned and beautified! There are many other such narrations which we do not mention here for the sake of brevity.

Obviously the reason these narrations are invalid and false is quite clear. Another instance is the story of the death of Umm Kulthum during the time of Muawiyah as reported by Sunni narrators. The report that she died during Muawiyah's reign is untrue because she was present in the event of Karbala and there are reports confirming her presence in the incidents that took place on the Day of Ashura.

Therefore, that lady who died on the same day as Zaid, and on whom a certain individual prayed was one of Umar's wives with her name being either Umm Kulthum (as she had wives whose names or nicknames were Umm Kulthum) or she was someone bearing a name other than Umm Kulthum.36

Assuming the authenticity of their narrations and their isnad [chains of transmission], this probability is reaffirmed by the narrations of Abu Dawud, Nesai and others. Thus, there is no reliable report to prove that Umm Kulthum, the daughter of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) bore Umar a child called Zaid. That is because there is no evidence apart from the narrations that were proved to be worthless and fabricated.

Likewise, there is no report or evidence to prove that she gave birth to a daughter, not to mention the fact that the narrators themselves have discrepant views as to the story itself as well as the name of that daughter.

It is further reaffirmed by Muslim scholars who have said: When Umar died, Umm Kulthum was still young and immature. One of those scholars is Sheikh Abu Muhammad Nawbakhti who is one of the early Shiite scholars. In his Al-Imamah, he writes: Umm Kulthum was young and juvenile and Umar died before consummating marriage with her.37

Likewise, Sheikh Abu Abdullah Muhammad ibn Abdul Baqi Zarqani Maliki (d.1122)38 while elaborating on the meaning of kinship of the holy Prophet (S) makes reference to the same point saying: Kinship refers to people who are related to the closest grandfather of the Messenger of Allah (S) i.e. Abdul Muttalib because the Prophet (S) said:

من صنع إلى أحد من ولد عبد المطلب يدا فلم يكافئه بها في الدنيا فعلي مكافاته إذا لقيتني

"Whoever treats well any of the children of Abdul Muttalib and does him a favor and he does not not make up for the favor in this world, it will be necessary upon me to make it up on the Day of Judgment when he shall meet me."

Tabarani has reported this tradition in Al-Mu'ujam Al-Awsat. Hence, those who are related to people before Abdul Muttalib like the children of Abdul Manaf, or the people who are in the same level related to Abdul Manaf, for example the children of Hashim, the brothers of Abdul Muttalib or the people related to him but who did not see him or associated with him, are excluded from his kinship.

It seems that kinship does not refer to the men and women who were in the company of the Messenger of Allah (S) and did not see him; but it refers to Ali and his children; Hassan, Hussain, Mohassin and Umm Kulthum, the wife of the second caliph, Umar ibn Khattab.

In fact, Umar died before Umm Kulthum reached the age of puberty and Awn ibn Ja'far married her. He also departed and she got married to his brother, Muhammad. He too died and she got married to Abdullah, the brother of those two. Umm Kulthum died in his house and did not bear a child with any of those three, except Muhammad, for whom she bore a daughter who died, while still a child. Thus, Umm Kulthum does not have any children or descendents as the author mentioned in the second section of this book.39

Furthermore, assuming that Umar married Umm Kulthum, the fact that Umm Kulthum did not bear a child is reaffirmed by Umar who stressed that he did not want anything by making a marriage proposal but to be the son- in-law of Holy Prophet (S). He insisted that he wanted to be one of the members of the Prophet's household (a.s.). He declared that he did not seek to gain anything except relationship with the Messenger of Allah through marriage with Umm Kulthum.

1. Manaqib Al-Imam Ali bin Abi Talib (a.s.), Ibn Maghazali, 134 & 135.
2. Dhakhair Al-Uqba fi Manaqib Dhawi Al-Qurba, 286.
3. Al-Durriyat Al-Tahirah, 160.
4. A raised place with a roof made of leaves of date-palm trees and it is a resting place for the poor and miserable.
5. Hiliyat Al-Awliya", 2/42.
6. Dhakhair Al-Uqba, 289.

7. Dhakhair Al-Uqba, 289.
8. Al-Sunan Al- Kubra, 7/185 number 13660.
9. Al-Durriyat Al-Tahirah, 162 and 163; Dhakhair Al-Uqba, 290.
10. Al-Durriyat Al-Tahirah, 157 and 158; Dhakhair Al-Uqba, 286.
11. Refer to: Dhakhair Al-Uqba, 289.
12. It is worth mentioning that in the Islamic laws (of both the Sunni and Shia sects) specific laws on how to treat a slave have been discussed which are not comparable with the laws regarding a free woman. In any case, the meanness and obscenity of Umar's action remains in place and what Ibn Jauzi Hanafi means from the above statement refers to the very point.
13. Tadhkirat Al-Khawas, 288 and 289.
14. Al-Tabaqat Al-Kubra, 8/339, Kanzul Ummal, 13/269 number 37576, Al-Isti"ab, 4/509, Usd Al- Ghabah, 7/378, Al-Isabah, 8/465.
15. Dhakhair Al-Uqba, 287. To understand the meaning of this kind of congratulation, refer to Lisan Al-Arab and other books in Arabic grammar to find the word "Rifa'a".
16. Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal, 4/484. Refer to Wasail Al-Shia, 14/183 tradition number 25550.
17. Tahzib Al-Asma wa Al-Lughat, 2/334.
18. Al-Ma'aref, 122.
19. Al-Isti'ab, 3/315.
20. Al-Isti'ab, 3/423 and 424.
21. Al-Isabah, 4, 4/ 619.
22. Usd Al-Ghabah, 4, 302.
23. Tarikh Tabari, 3/ 174, Al-Kamil fi Al-Tarikh, 2/550.
24. Al-Tabaqat Al-Kubra: 8/338.
25. Al Ma"arif, 122.
26. Al-Isti"b, 3/424.
27. Al-Tabaqat Al-Kubra, 8/340.
28. Tahdhib Al-Asma, Wa Lughat, 1/249.
29. Al-Isabah, 8/166 and 167.
30. Tarikh Al-Khamis, 2/285.
31. Sunan Al-Nesai, 4/374 number 1976.
32. Faidh Al- Qadir, 5/27.
33. Kanzul Ummal, 11/183 number 31911 & 31912
34. Manaqib Al-Imam Ali ibn Abi Talib (a.s.), 133 & 134.
35. Refer to the thesis that we have written in this regard.
36. Ifham Al-A"ada Wa Al- Khusum, 2/72 – 212.
37. Bihar Al-Anwar, 42/91.
38. His biography can be read in Silk Al- DurarfFi A"ayan Al- Qarn Al-Thani Ashar, 4/32
39. Sharh Al-Mawahib Al-Ladoniyyah, 7/9 and 10, theme: Mabhath Qarabat Al-Nabi (S).

Section 4: Umar's Marriage to Umm Kulthum in Shiite Narrations[1]

As we was mentioned while raising a question regarding Umm Kulthum's marriage to Umar ibn Khattab, the story is famous and well- known among Sunni Muslims and the narrations regarding this marriage have also been reported in the books authored by Shia scholars. However, in spite of this story being well-known among Sunni Muslims and the fact that it has also been reported in some Shiite sources, some of our scholars have rejected the story on the ground that it is not true and genuine. If one goes

through Shiite sources, he will see the rejection and refutation in the works authored by Sheikh Mufid, Sayyid Murtadha and Sayyid Nasir Hussain, the son of the author of Abaqat Al–Anwar (may Allah bless him) – and in the works by other figures who have engaged in the analysis and evaluation of this very subject matter.

Here we reiterate that the narrations reported by reliable Shiite narrators indicate and reveal what we have already stated in our answer to the forgoing question. In this respect, we quoted Nawbakhti, one of the Shiite scholars, and also Zarqani, a Sunnite scholar. Now we shall mention and elaborate on the narrations reported by Shiite sources through reliable chains of transmission.2

The first tradition

Imam Ja'far Sadiq (S.A) has been reported as having said concerning the marriage of Umm Kulthum:

إن ذلك فرج غصبناه

"That this was the farj that was usurped from us."

The second tradition

It has been narrated in another narration that Imam Sadiq (a.s.) said:

لما خطب اليه قال له أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام: إنها صبية.

قال : فلقي العباس فقال له: ما لي؟ ابي بأس؟

قال: وما ذاك؟

قال: خطبت إلى ابن اخيك فردني اما والله! لأعورن زمزم ولا ادع لكم مكرمة إلا هدمتها ولأقيمن عليه شاهدين بأنه سرق ولأقتعن يمينه.

فأته العباس وسأله ان يجعل الأمر اليه فجعله اليه.

‘When Umar came to make the marriage proposal, the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) told him: She is a young girl.

Thereupon, Umar met Abbas and told him: What is wrong with me? Do I have any defect?

Abbas said: Why are you saying that?

Umar said: I asked your nephew for his daughter‘s hand in marriage, but he has turned me down. I swear by Allah! I will fill the well of Zamzam with earth, I will destroy every honor that you have, and I will set up two witnesses to testify that he stole, that I may cut off his right hand.‘ Abbas thereupon came to Ali and informed him of what had transpired. He asked Ali to put the matter in his hands, and Ali complied.’3

The third tradition

In another narration reported from Sulaiman ibn Khalid and others, Sulaiman has been quoted as having said: I asked Imam Sadiq (a.s.) as to where a lady whose husband had died should pass her Iddah (waiting) period4. Was it necessary for her to pass the period in her husband‘s house or wherever she wanted?

The Imam (a.s.) said: Yes, she can pass her waiting period wherever she would like to. Then he said:

إن عليا عليه السلام لما مات عمر أتى أم كلثوم فأخذ بيدها فأنطلق بها إلى بيته.

When Umar died, Ali (a.s.) went to Umm Kulthum, got hold of her hand and brought her to his house.5

In view of the above details and assuming that the narrations are true and authentic, we say: The opponents cannot use these narrations to base their arguments and prove their side of the story or to make us accept anything in this regard. This is because the utmost conclusion that can be drawn from these narrations is that the marriage contract took place under threat and intimidating promises. It was only after these threats that Umm Kulthum went to Umar‘s house. When Umar was killed, the Imam (a.s.) went to Umm Kulthum and took her to his house.

On the other hand, perhaps this saying of Imam Ja‘far Sadiq (a.s.) i.e., Ali (a.s.) held her hand and took her to his house is a proof of what some scholars have stated that Umar died before Umm Kulthum

attained the age of puberty.

Therefore, what merit does this proposal and the imposed marriage which was characterized by threat and intimidation does it earn Umar? What defect and flaw does such a proposal and marriage exact on the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) and the Household of the Prophet, peace be upon them? Can such a marriage be an indication of the two sides being sincere friends of each other?

When Umar threatens the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.), in the manner demonstrated by the narrations, to usurp and get this girl, how may his threats have been for usurping the caliphate which forcibly silenced the Commander of the Faithful (a.s.) and his followers compelling them to pay allegiance to him?! In fact, we can say that this usurpation was meant to eliminate the effects of that usurpation.

Indeed, Hajjaj ibn Yusuf Thaqafi learnt this same method from Umar as evidenced by this historical narration: Muhammad ibn Idris Shafe'i (d.) says: When Hajjaj ibn Yusuf married the daughter of Abdullah ibn Ja'far, Khalid ibn Yazid ibn Muawiyah told Abdul Malik ibn Marwan:
Did you leave Hajjaj to marry the daughter of Abdullah ibn Ja'far? He said: Yes, what is wrong with it?

Khalid said: By Allah, this is the worst shame. Abdul Malik asked: How is that?

Khalid said: I swear by Allah! O Commander of the Faithful, ever since I married Ramlah, the daughter of Zubair, the enmity I had in my heart toward Zubair, has perished. Khalid goes on saying: It seems Abdul Malik was asleep and I woke him up with these words of mine. Then and there he wrote a letter to Hajjaj making him to divorce Abdullah's daughter. Hajjaj complied with Abdul Malik's order and divorced her.6

Final word concerning the marriage of Umm Kulthum

Considering the investigation and research conducted in regard to Umm Kulthum's marriage, a question that does arise is: Whom did Umm Kulthum marry finally? In answer to this question, we must say that it was clarified earlier that, based on the saying of Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.), he had kept his daughters for the sons of his brother, Ja'far. In fact, this was done by the order of the Messenger of Allah (S) because one day the holy Prophet (S) looked at Ali's and Ja'far's children whereupon the Prophet (S) said:

بناتنا لبنينا وبنونا لبناتنا

"Our daughters are for our sons and our sons are for our daughters".7

However, when it comes to Umm Kulthum, there is a narration which says: Umar asked Ali for Umm

Kulthum‘s hand in marriage. Ali (AS) made the excuse that she was too young and he further said that he had kept her for the son of his brother, Ja‘far…8

Likewise it is seen in this narration that the Imam (a.s.) did not specify which son of Ja‘far he had kept his daughter for, but we know that he meant either Awn or Muhammad. This is because, as mentioned earlier, the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) had married his daughter Zainab (a.s.) to Abdullah, who was the eldest of his brothers.

Among the Sunni scholars, whose opinions and reports we are discussing in this book, there is no difference as to the fact that Awn was killed in the battle of Shushtar, during the reign of Umar‘s caliphate. Hence, based on the aforementioned narrations which we assume to be authentic, Umm Kulthum was married to Umar during this time.

When it comes to Muhammad, ibn Ja‘far, Ibn Hajar comments as such:

Abu Umar has narrated from Waqidi that Muhammad‘s nickname was Abul Qasim. He married Umm Kulthum after Umar‘s death. He further says: Muhammad was martyred in the battle of Shushtar.

It has been said that Muhammad lived until the time of Imam Ali (a.s.) and was in the company of the Commander of the Faithful, Ali (a.s.) during the battle of Siffin.

In his Al-Ikhwah, Dar Qutni writes: It is said that Muhammad was martyred in the battle of Siffin. In this battle, he fought with Ubaidullah ibn Umar ibn Khattab and they fought each other to their death.

In this respect, Marzbani too writes in Mu‟jam Al-Shuara: Muhammad ibn Ja‘far and Muhammad ibn Abi Bakr were in Egypt. When Muhammad ibn Abi Bakr was killed, Muhammad went into hiding. A person from the clan of Ak and the tribe of Ghafiq advised him to leave Egypt and he fled there for Palestine where he went to one of maternal uncles from Khath‘am clan. He saved Muhammad from Muawiyah‘s mischief. Later on, Muhammad composed a poem describing this incident.

He further writes: This has been proven and it rejects Waqidi who said that Muhammad was martyred in the battle of Shushtar.9

So, the person who married Umm Kulthum, after Umar‘s death, based on the foregoing supposition, is Muhammad ibn Ja‘far and, as was stated earlier, Ibn Abd al-Barr has confirmed this. Concerning Abdullah too, it is necessary to know that he is likely to have married Umm Kulthum after the death of his wife Zainab (S.A). That is because according to Ibn Abd al- Barr, Abdullah was alive until the year 80 of the Islamic lunar calendar and he lived for ninety years.

1. It is worth mentioning that the previous edition of this book lacked this section as it was added only in the wake of a request by some scholars and seminarians. That was because my study was focused only on Sunni traditions and narrations in connection with the subject matter. It is expected that this section will be supplementary and that it will throw further light on the answers given briefly in this book.
2. Of course in this topic there are other traditions in the sources of the Shia which after a careful evaluation, we have

realized that on the part of their documents, they have been tampered with and disclaimed.

3. Al-Kafi, 5/346 tradition number 1 and 2.

4. Iddah is a waiting period of (four months and ten days) during which a lady who has lost her husband, must stay away from marriage.

5. Al-Kafi, 6/115 and 116 tradition number 2, this information because of its application in the aforesaid law, it has also been mentioned in the books of Islamic laws.

6. Mukhtasar Tarikh Dimashq, 6/205.

7. Man la Yahdhuruhu Al-Faqih, 3/249 tradition number 1184.

8. Dhakhair Uqba, 288; Kanzul Ummal, 13/269 tradition number 37586.

9. Al-Isabah, 6/7.

The discussion was about Umm Kulthum's marriage to Umar. The story was narrated from the most famous books authored by Sunni scholars. In this study, we unveiled the most hidden aspects of the story carefully examining the chains of the narrations, their significations, the narrators and their goals. The truth of the matter was explained and substantiated and the controversies came to an end.

Assuming that Hazrat Zahra (a.s.) had a daughter by the name of Umm Kulthum and that marriage in Islam takes place only when the formula of marriage contract is recited, therefore, based on the few narrations mentioned in Kulayni's Al-Kafi, we can conclude that:

Umar asked Ali (a.s.) for Umm Kulthum's hand in marriage and the Imam (a.s.) made the excuse that she was too young and that she was engaged to her cousin. After Umar's repeated proposal, frequenting and resorting to threat to intimidate the Commander of the Faithful, (a.s.) and Bani Hashemi, the Imam left the matter to be decided by his uncle Abbas; the marriage took place in the sense that only a marriage contract was concluded without Ali (a.s.) and his daughter consenting to it.

That was why no sooner Umar died than Ali (a.s.) returned his daughter to his house. Hence, what has been narrated in some Sunni books about the girl dressing up and going to Umar under the pretext of handing over a piece of garment is baseless and undocumented scientifically. The same is the case with the report about Umm Kulthum's death occurring simultaneously with the death of her child from Umar.

The conclusion is that this incident cannot be used to cover up Umar's conduct towards the household of the Prophet (S) during Lady Zahra's lifetime. Likewise, they cannot use this story to argue that the Commander of the Faithful, Ali, peace be upon him, was in good and friendly terms with Umar.

Ihya Uloom Al-Deen, Abu Hamed Ghazzali, Dar Al-Ma'refah, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Isti'ab, Ibn Abd Al-Barr, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1415 AH.

Usd Al-Ghabah, Ibn Athir, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Isabah, Ibn Hajar Asqalani, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1415 AH.

Ifham Al-A‟da wa Al-Khusum, Allamah Sayed Nasir Hussain Musavi Hindi, New Naynaw Library.

Al-Ansab, Sam‟ani, Dar Al-Fikr Publications, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1408 AH.

Behar Al-Anwar, Muhammad Baqir Majlisi, Dar Al-Ihya Al-Turath Al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, 1403 AH.

Tarikh Baghdad, Khatib Baghdadi, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1417 AH.

Tarikh Al-Khamis, Diyar Bakri, Dar Sader Publication‘s, Lebanon.

Tarikh Al-Tabari, Tabari, Uroomiyah Bookstall Publications, Qom, Iran

Tazkirat Al-Khawas, Sibt bin Jawzi, Ahlul-Bayt (a.s.) Institute, Beirut, Lebanon, 1401 AH.

Taqrib Al-Tahzib, Ibn Hajar Asqalani, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1415 AH.

Talkhis Al-Mustadrak, Dhahabi, Dar Al-Ma‘refah, Beirut, Lebanon.

Tahzib Al-Asma wa Al-Lughat, Nawavi, Dar Al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, first edtion, 1416.

Tahzib Al-Tahzib, Ibn Hajar Al-Asqalani, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1415 AH.

Husn Al-Muhadherah, Suyuti, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1418 AH.

Hilyat Al-Awlia, Abu Na‘eim Isfahani, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edtion, 1418 AH.

Dhakahir Al-Uqba, Muhibbuddin Tabari, Al-Sahabah Library, Jeddah, Al- Sharqiyah, Al-Tabe‘ein Library, Cairo, first edition, 1415 AH.

Al-Durriat Al-Tahira, Muhammad bin Ahmad Ansari, Razi Dulabi, researched by Sayed Muhammad Jawad Husseini Jalali, Islamic Publications Institute, Qom, Iran, 1407 AH.

Silk Al-Durar fi A‟yan Al-Qar Al-Thani Ashar, Muradi, Al-Muthanna Library, Baghdad Iraq.

Sunan Abi Dawood, Abi Dawood, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1416 AH.

Al-Sunan Al-Kubra, Bayhaqi, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1414 AH.

Sunan Al-Nesai, Nesai, with annotation by Suyuti and Marginal Notes by Sindi, Dar Al-Ma‘refah, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, 1414 AH.

Sharh Al-Mawahib Al-Laduniyah, Qastalani, Dar Al-Ma'refah, Beirut, Lebanon, 1414 AH.

Al-Dhu"afa Al-Kabir, Uqaili, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon.

Tabaqat Al-Huffadh, Suyuti, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1414 AH.

Al-Tabaqat Al-Kubra, Ibn Sa'ad, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1418 AH.

Ghayat Al-Nehayah fi Tabaqat Al-Qura, Jazari Shafe'i, Khanji Library, Egypt, 1351 AH.

Faidh Al-Qadir, Manawi, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1415 AH.

Al-Kashif, Dhahabi, Dar Al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1418 AH.

Al-Kafi, Muhammad bin Ya'qub Kulayani, Dar Sa'b, Dar Al-Ta'aruf Publication's, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, 1401 AH.

Al-Kamil, Ibn Athir, Dar Al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1399.

Al-Kamil fi Dhu"afa Al-Rijal, Ibn Adi, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, Beirut, first edition, 1418 AH.

Kitb Al-Majruhin, Ibn Hibban, Dar Al-Ma'refah, Beirut, Lebanon, 1412 AH.

Kanzul Ummal, Muttaqi Hindi, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1419 AH.

Lisan Al-Arab, Ibn Madhur Afriqi, Beirut, Lebanon.

Turathuna Magazine, Aalulbayt (a.s.) Institute for Reviving (Islamic) Legacy, Qom, Iran.

Majma" Al-Zawaed wa Manba" Al-Fawaed, Haythami, Dar Al-Fikr, Beirut, Lebanon, 1412.

Mukhtasar Tarikh Dimashq, Ibn Mandhur, Dar Al-Fikr, Syria, Damascus, first edition, 1404 AH.

Mer"at Al-Jenan, Yafe'ei, Dar Al-Kotob Al-Islamiyah, Cairo, Egypt, second edition, 1413.

Al-Mustadrak, Hakim Nishaburi, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1411 AH.

Musnad Ahmad bin Hanbal, Ahmad b. Hanbal, Dar Ihya Al-Turath Al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, third edition, 1415 AH.

Al-Ma"aref, Ibn Qutaibah, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1407 AH.

Ma"refat Al-Sahabah, Abu Na'eim Isfahani, Beirut, Lebanon.

Al-Mughni fi Al-Dhu"afa, Dhahabi, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1418 AH.

Al-Manqib, Ibn Maghazali, Dar Al-Adhwa, Beirut, Lebanon, second edition, 1214 AH.

Man La Yahdhuruhu Al-Faqih, Shaykh Saduq, Dar Sa'b, Dar Al-Ta'aruf, Beirut, Lebanon, 1401 AH.

Mizan Al-E"tidal, Dhahabi, Da Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyah, Beirut, Lebanon, first edition, 1416.

Wasail Al-Shi'ah, Sheikh Hurr Amili, Dar Ihya Al-Turath Al-Arabi, Beirut, Lebanon, fifth edition, 1403 AH.

Source URL:
https://www.al-islam.org/critical-assessment-umm-kulthums-marriage-umar-sayyid-ali-al-husayni-al-milani

Links
[1] https://www.al-islam.org/user/login?destination=node/40380%23comment-form
[2] https://www.al-islam.org/user/register?destination=node/40380%23comment-form
[3] https://www.al-islam.org/person/sayyid-ali-al-husayni-al-milani
[4] https://www.al-islam.org/person/jawid-akbari
[5] https://www.al-islam.org/library/early-islamic-history
[6] https://www.al-islam.org/feature/debates-discussions
[7] https://www.al-islam.org/feature/resources-further-research
[8] https://www.al-islam.org/feature/responses-misconceptions
[9] https://www.al-islam.org/person/umm-kulthum
[10] https://www.al-islam.org/person/umar-b-al-khattab